



NAVAL POSTGRADUATE SCHOOL

MONTEREY, CALIFORNIA

THESIS

**DEVELOPMENT ASSISTANCE IN HAITI: WHERE HAS
THE MONEY GONE?**

by

Scott M. Anderson

December 2014

Thesis Advisor:

Thomas C. Bruneau

Second Reader:

Robert E. Looney

Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

REPORT DOCUMENTATION PAGE			Form Approved OMB No. 0704-0188	
Public reporting burden for this collection of information is estimated to average 1 hour per response, including the time for reviewing instruction, searching existing data sources, gathering and maintaining the data needed, and completing and reviewing the collection of information. Send comments regarding this burden estimate or any other aspect of this collection of information, including suggestions for reducing this burden, to Washington headquarters Services, Directorate for Information Operations and Reports, 1215 Jefferson Davis Highway, Suite 1204, Arlington, VA 22202-4302, and to the Office of Management and Budget, Paperwork Reduction Project (0704-0188) Washington DC 20503.				
1. AGENCY USE ONLY (Leave blank)		2. REPORT DATE December 2014		3. REPORT TYPE AND DATES COVERED Master's Thesis
4. TITLE AND SUBTITLE DEVELOPMENT ASSISTANCE IN HAITI: WHERE HAS THE MONEY GONE?			5. FUNDING NUMBERS	
6. AUTHOR(S) Scott M. Anderson				
7. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) Naval Postgraduate School Monterey, CA 93943-5000			8. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION REPORT NUMBER	
9. SPONSORING /MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES) N/A			10. SPONSORING/MONITORING AGENCY REPORT NUMBER	
11. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES The views expressed in this thesis are those of the author and do not reflect the official policy or position of the Department of Defense or the U.S. Government. IRB Protocol number ____N/A____.				
12a. DISTRIBUTION / AVAILABILITY STATEMENT Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited			12b. DISTRIBUTION CODE	
13. ABSTRACT (maximum 200 words) This thesis analyzes the level of effectiveness of the development assistance that Haiti has received since being struck by an earthquake on January 12, 2010. Despite receiving billions of dollars in development assistance, Haiti has little tangible results to show for all of the money spent. According to a 2014 report from the United Nations Special Envoy to Haiti, \$6.43 billion of this aid has already been disbursed. This thesis analyzes the political and socioeconomic history of Haiti focusing on the progress and changes over the past five years since receiving the additional economic assistance and documenting the challenges facing Haiti moving forward. This thesis finds that Haiti the political and socioeconomic climate is extremely intricate and complex and progress is difficult to measure. It concludes that over half of the allocated funds have been allocated to consumable resources that do not provide any enduring benefit to the nation, but that many of the resources were spent on opportunistic NGOs without the knowledge or consent of the Haitian government. Despite historical precedence, the Haitian government needs more autonomy in determining its future if it is going to achieve enduring prosperity.				
14. SUBJECT TERMS Haiti, economics, earthquake			15. NUMBER OF PAGES 81	
			16. PRICE CODE	
17. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF REPORT Unclassified	18. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF THIS PAGE Unclassified	19. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF ABSTRACT Unclassified	20. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT UU	

NSN 7540-01-280-5500

Standard Form 298 (Rev. 2-89)
Prescribed by ANSI Std. Z39-18

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited

DEVELOPMENT ASSISTANCE IN HAITI: WHERE HAS THE MONEY GONE?

Scott M. Anderson
Major, United States Army
B.S., Hope College (Holland, MI), 1999

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of

MASTER OF ARTS IN SECURITY STUDIES (WESTERN HEMISPHERE)

from the

**NAVAL POSTGRADUATE SCHOOL
December 2014**

Author: Scott M. Anderson

Approved by: Thomas C. Bruneau
Thesis Advisor

Robert E. Looney
Second Reader

Mohammed Hafez
Chair, Department of National Security Affairs

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

ABSTRACT

This thesis analyzes the level of effectiveness of the development assistance that Haiti has received since being struck by an earthquake on January 12, 2010. Despite receiving billions of dollars in development assistance, Haiti has little tangible results to show for all of the money spent. According to a 2014 report from the United Nations Special Envoy to Haiti, \$6.43 billion of this aid has already been disbursed.

This thesis analyzes the political and socioeconomic history of Haiti focusing on the progress and changes over the past five years since receiving the additional economic assistance and documenting the challenges facing Haiti moving forward. This thesis finds that Haiti the political and socioeconomic climate is extremely intricate and complex and progress is difficult to measure. It concludes that over half of the allocated funds have been allocated to consumable resources that do not provide any enduring benefit to the nation, but that many of the resources were spent on opportunistic NGOs without the knowledge or consent of the Haitian government. Despite historical precedence, the Haitian government needs more autonomy in determining its future if it is going to achieve enduring prosperity.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I.	INTRODUCTION.....	1
A.	MAJOR RESEARCH QUESTION.....	1
B.	SIGNIFICANCE OF THE RESEARCH QUESTION.....	1
C.	LITERATURE REVIEW	3
D.	POTENTIAL EXPLANATIONS AND HYPOTHESES	7
E.	RESEARCH DESIGN	9
F.	OVERVIEW AND FINDINGS.....	10
II.	HAITI’S GOVERNMENT AND ECONOMY.....	13
A.	SPANISH RULE: 1492–1697.....	13
B.	FRENCH RULE: 1697–1791	16
C.	THE HAITIAN REVOLUTION: 1791–1804.....	17
D.	POST-REVOLUTION HAITI: 1804–1915	20
E.	UNITED STATES MILITARY INTERVENTION IN HAITI AND AFTERMATH: 1915–1957	22
F.	THE DUVALIERIST REGIMES: 1957–1986	26
G.	ARISTIDE AND HAITI’S TRANSITION TO DEMOCRACY: 1986– 2010.....	29
III.	SOCIOECONOMIC CONDITIONS IN HAITI.....	33
A.	JANUARY 12, 2010: THE PORT-AU-PRINCE EARTHQUAKE.....	34
B.	LEADERSHIP TRANSITION: THE MARTELLY ADMINISTRATION	36
C.	AID AND RECONSTRUCTION EFFORTS IN RESPONSE TO THE EARTHQUAKE.....	39
D.	SIGNS OF PROGRESS AND HOPE FOR THE FUTURE	47
IV.	CONCLUSIONS	51
	APPENDIX.....	57
	LIST OF REFERENCES.....	59
	INITIAL DISTRIBUTION LIST	65

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.	Presidents of Haiti.....	57
----------	--------------------------	----

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

LIST OF ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

GDP	Gross Domestic Product
IDB	Inter-American Development Bank
MINUSTAH	United Nations Stabilization Mission in Haiti
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
NSPFM	National Systems for Public Financial Management and Procurement
UN	United Nations
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
WHO	World Health Organization

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to extend my most sincere appreciation to my thesis advisor, Professor Thomas Bruneau, and my second reader, Professor Robert Looney, for the amount of time they have devoted to making this thesis a reality and for their unwavering patience throughout this process. I am deeply grateful for your wisdom and guidance.

To my family and friends, I would not have been able to accomplish this task without your love and support. I am truly blessed to have you in my life.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

I. INTRODUCTION

A. MAJOR RESEARCH QUESTION

The aim of this thesis is to analyze the level of effectiveness of the development assistance that Haiti has received since 2010. At the beginning of the 19th century, Haiti was the most profitable colony in the Western Hemisphere.¹ Since gaining independence in 1804, however, Haiti has been wracked with poverty.² Despite receiving billions of dollars in development assistance, including over \$4 billion from the United States between 1998 and 2008, Haiti has little to show for it.³ The most recent setback in Haiti was an earthquake on January 12, 2010 that brought international attention to the dire situation in Haiti and resulted in \$13.34 billion committed to the Haitian relief effort.⁴ As of 2012, \$6.43 billion of this aid was disbursed.⁵ Now, nearly five years after the earthquake, this thesis will seek to determine if Haiti has made any economic progress and if Haiti is finally on the path to prosperity, or if it is destined to remain a failed state.

B. SIGNIFICANCE OF THE RESEARCH QUESTION

Despite being just the 147th largest country and the 84th most populated, there are several factors that make this island nation historically and regionally relevant. Haiti is just 600 miles off the coast of Florida, sharing the island of Hispaniola with the Dominican Republic.⁶ For centuries, Haiti has been one of the poorest and worst

¹ Robert D. Heinl and Nancy G. Heinl, *Written in Blood: The Story of the Haitian people, 1492–1971*, (Boston, MA: Houghton Mifflin, 1978), 30–31.

² Maureen Taft-Morales, *Haiti Under President Martelly: Current Conditions and Congressional Concerns*, (Washington, DC: CRS, 2014), i.

³ Terry F. Buss and Adam Gardner, *Haiti in the Balance: Why Foreign Aid Has Failed and What We Can Do About It* (Washington, DC: Brookings Institution Press, 2008), 1.

⁴ “International Assistance: General Information on the Status of Aid to Haiti,” Office of the Secretary-General’s Special Adviser on Community-Based Medicine & Lessons Learned from Haiti, United Nations, accessed May 28, 2014, http://www.lessonsfromhaiti.org/download/International_Assistance/1-overall-key-facts.pdf.

⁵ Ibid.

⁶ Buss and Gardner, *Haiti in the Balance*, 1.

governed countries in the world.⁷ Haiti's current condition has the potential to adversely affect the surrounding area, especially when taking into account the number of refugees that flee to the United States in times of crisis. Haiti exists in a perpetual state of violence and instability, and recently it has taken an increased role in illegal drug trafficking from South America.⁸

The United States has intervened in Haiti numerous times. The United States sent an occupation force from 1915–1934,⁹ sent armed forces to restore democracy in 1994,¹⁰ and intervened in halting a coup d'état in 2004.¹¹ Another United States military intervention may occur if the situation in Haiti devolves to the point where there is another coup d'état.

There would be several benefits to the region in general and particularly the United States in Haiti becoming an economic success. Haiti has the potential to be a larger trading partner with the United States; there is a strong Haitian-American diaspora, and fostering a positive relationship with Haiti can increase ties to the rest of the Latin American and Caribbean community. It is in the best interest of the United States to ensure the developmental assistance provided to Haiti is being used responsibly.

Even before the earthquake in Haiti, the question of development assistance was an issue. The National Academy of Public Administration addressed this issue in 2004 at a meeting of the Reconstruction Partnership/Fragile Nations Project.¹² With 38 public sector bilateral and multilateral donor groups pledging over \$10.3 billion to relief and recovery efforts, Haiti needs to be held accountable to act responsibly for the betterment

⁷ Taft-Morales, *Haiti Under President Martelly*, i.

⁸ *Ibid.*, 36.

⁹ Hans Schmidt, *The United States Occupation of Haiti, 1915–1934*, (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1971), 24.

¹⁰ John R. Ballard, *Upholding Democracy: The United States Military Campaign in Haiti, 1994–1997* (Westport, Conn.: Praeger, 1998), 49.

¹¹ Paul Farmer, "Who Removed Aristide?," *London Review of Books* 26, no. 8 (2004): 30.

¹² "2010–2012 Overall Contributions from Public Sector Donors to Relief and Recovery Efforts in Haiti as of December 2012, in USD Millions (Excluding Debt Relief)," Office of the Special Envoy for Haiti, United Nations, accessed June 4, 2014, http://www.lessonsfromhaiti.org/download/International_Assistance/2-overall-financing-data.pdf.

of the nation, something it has repeatedly failed to do.¹³ Nearly five years after the 2010 earthquake, it is worthwhile to ask whether those investments, coupled with changes in governmental structure and national policies, have resulted in any significant progress and determine what remains to be done.

C. LITERATURE REVIEW

Due to several significant events that highlight Haiti's storied past, there is abundant literature available on Haiti. This literature is divided into three main categories: political history, economic history, and international aid.

The first category of literature centers on Haiti's political and governmental development. Several sources document the leadership challenges that Haiti faced between achieving freedom and modern day. One of the better sources documenting Haiti's governmental development is chapter 2 and 3 of "Political Parties and Democracy in Haiti."¹⁴ It provides a solid explanation of how Haitian politics has evolved from Haiti's independence through 2001. Even though it does not cover Haiti's current political environment, this thesis provides the context that shapes modern Haitian politics.

Another good source capturing Haiti's governmental history is *Haiti's Predatory Republic: The Unending Transition to Democracy*. Chapters 3 and 4 of this book present another account of the roots of the contemporary political challenges Haiti faces.¹⁵ Despite providing an excellent analysis between the end of the Duvalier dictatorship in 1986 to Aristide's second inauguration in 2001, there is a gap covering the politics from 2001 to the present day.

Tectonic Shifts: Haiti since the Earthquake provides an account of the most recent political developments in Haiti. Despite covering the brief period between 2010 and early

¹³ "2010–2012 Overall Contributions from Public Sector Donors to Relief and Recovery Efforts in Haiti as of December 2012, in USD Millions (Excluding Debt Relief)."

¹⁴ Matthew J. Jerbi, "Political Parties and Democracy in Haiti," (master's thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, 2001), 31–88.

¹⁵ Robert Fatton, *Haiti's Predatory Republic: The Unending Transition to Democracy* (Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner Publishers, 2002), 51–106.

2012, this book helps to explain the contemporary politics in Haiti from the end of President Préval's term to the beginning of Martelly's Presidency.¹⁶

A Congressional Research Service report of February 2014, titled "Haiti under President Martelly: Current Conditions and Congressional Concerns," discusses President Martelly's leadership and actions in Haiti.¹⁷ It discusses strategies for Haiti's reconstruction and international assistance.¹⁸ It also lays out the policy objectives and assistance plan the United States has for Haiti.¹⁹

As much attention as Haiti's government has received, its economic challenges have received even more attention. A great resource documenting the economic history of Haiti is *Haiti: The Politics of Squalor*. Covering from 1750 through the 1960s, this book illustrates how the current economic challenges are nothing new to Haiti.²⁰ It describes how economic opportunities have been wasted in the past and sees the current economic challenges facing Haiti as no surprise.

The United States Senate Committee on Foreign Relations published two reports on economic assistance and economic affairs in Haiti in 2011. The first report focuses on promoting sustainable private sector growth and economic development in Haiti.²¹ The second report focused on rebuilding Haiti in the Martelly era.²² As President Martelly's

¹⁶ Mark Schuller, and Pablo Morales, *Tectonic Shifts: Haiti Since the Earthquake*, (Sterling, VA: Kumarian Press, 2012).

¹⁷ Maureen Taft-Morales, *Haiti Under President Martelly*, 6–10.

¹⁸ *Ibid.*, 15–19.

¹⁹ *Ibid.*, 21–38.

²⁰ Robert I. Rotberg and Christopher K. Clague, *Haiti: the Politics of Squalor* (Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1971).

²¹ United States Congress, Senate, Committee on Foreign Relations. *A Bill to Promote Sustainable Private Sector Growth and Economic Development in Haiti: Report (to Accompany S. 954)* (Washington, DC: U.S. G.P.O., 2011), 2–5.

²² United States, Congress, Senate, Committee on Foreign Relations. Subcommittee on Western Hemisphere, Peace Corps, and Economic Affairs United States. Congress. Senate. Committee on Foreign Relations. Subcommittee on International Development and Foreign Assistance. *Rebuilding Haiti in the Martelly Era: A Joint Hearing Before the Subcommittee On Western Hemisphere, Peace Corps, and Global Narcotics Affairs and the Subcommittee On International Development and Foreign Assistance, Economic Affairs, and International Environmental Protection of the Committee On Foreign Relations, United States Senate, One Hundred Twelfth Congress, First Session, June 23, 2011* (Washington: U.S. G.P.O., 2011), 17–26.

first term comes to a close, facing an election later this year, the plans laid out in these reports failed to achieve the desired results. Tying in these plans to Haiti's development aid distribution will provide an explanation for why the desired results were not achieved.

There have also been some recent positive articles regarding Haiti's economic prospects. "Haiti: Hope for a Fragile State," focuses on the society itself, the sources of difference, the origins of violence, and the possibility of change.²³ Although it was published prior to the 2010 earthquake, its findings are still relevant in explaining Haiti's economic development.

"Finally, Good News from Haiti," is another encouraging article. It shows the success of some community-based NGOs and the positive impacts they have made in the private sector.²⁴ If ventures like these can continue, there is hope for reduction in developmental aid requirements for Haiti, as well as increased political stability.

Deborah Gibbons wrote an article on the cultural and social aspects of recovery and growth in Haiti. Her article shows how some opportunistic Haitians are using possession of information or resources to ransom the members of their communities.²⁵ Her article emphasizes that Haitian society is divided into the socially elite minority and the poor majority. She indicates that by manipulating the delivery of developmental aid, the social elite NGOs are currently getting richer at the expense of the poor, local masses.²⁶

Much of the recent literature on Haiti focuses on poverty and international relief efforts, especially in response to the earthquake that hit Haiti in January 2010. Anna Versluis explored the formal and informal aid received following the 2010 earthquake by interviewing camp dwellers outside Port-au-Prince, Haiti's capital and most populous

²³ Yasmine Shamsie and Andrew S. Thompson, *Haiti: Hope for a Fragile State*, (Waterloo, Ontario: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2006).

²⁴ Robert Looney, "Finally, Good News From Haiti," *Foreign Policy (blog)*, May 3, 2013, http://www.foreignpolicy.com/articles/2013/05/03/finally_good_news_from_haiti.

²⁵ Deborah E. Gibbons, "Haiti: Cultural and Social Aspects of Recovery and Growth," *Feet on the Ground: Humanitarian Work Across Cultures* (Monterey, CA: Naval Postgraduate School, 2011), 5.

²⁶ *Ibid.*, 13.

city. Her article documents the inefficient and untimely distribution of aid, as well as the differences between formal and informal aid.²⁷

Two recent theses compared emergency response operations in Haiti to other countries in similar distress. Allende and Ayana demonstrate the importance of collaboration in humanitarian logistics when receiving aid, specifically comparing the responses in Haiti and Chile when each suffered an earthquake in 2010. Allende and Ayana found that neither system was very efficient at receiving and distributing aid, recommending greater planning, coordination, and collaboration with disaster response teams to increase the effectiveness of aid delivery.²⁸ Javed Niazi compared the earthquake in Haiti to a flood in Pakistan in 2010. Niazi noted a much stronger international response to Haiti than Pakistan for a variety of reasons. Among these reasons was proximity to the United States, a perception that Pakistan could do more to help itself, the relative stability of Haiti compared to Pakistan, and potential ties between Pakistan and the Taliban in Afghanistan.²⁹

“Cacophonies of Aid, Failed State Building and NGOs in Haiti,” is another excellent resource that presents the positive and negative sides of NGO involvement following a natural disaster. This article documents the damage the earthquake did by exposing the fragile nature of the administrative capacity of Haiti’s government.³⁰ While some NGOs stepped in as substitutes for the state and weakened Haiti’s institutions, this article highlights a couple of community-based NGOs that contributed durable services to their local communities.³¹

²⁷ Anna Versluis, “Formal and Informal Material Aid Following the 2010 Haiti Earthquake as Reported by Camp Dwellers,” *Disasters* 38, no. s1 (2014): S94.

²⁸ Victor Allende and Jorge Anaya, “Collaboration in Humanitarian Logistics: Comparative Analysis of Disaster Response in Chile and Haiti 2010,” (master’s thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, 2010), 51–53.

²⁹ Javed I. Niazi, “Comparative Analysis of Emergency Response Operations Haiti Earthquake in January 2010 and Pakistan’s Flood in 2010,” (master’s thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, 2011), 119–123.

³⁰ Laura Zanotti, “Cacophonies of Aid, Failed State Building and NGOs in Haiti: Setting the Stage for Disaster, Envisioning the Future,” *Third World Quarterly* 31, no. 5 (2010), <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/01436597.2010.503567>, 756.

³¹ *Ibid.*, 768.

Some of the literature addresses multiple categories. Terry Buss and Adam Gardner provide a wealth of information on the history and economic development in Haiti from independence through the election of President Rene Préval in 2006. Their book documents the historical instability of the Haitian government by showing that out of Haiti's 54 elected presidents only eight served their full term in office and three of those were during the United States occupation between 1915 and 1934.³² Buss and Gardner also discuss the reasons foreign aid has failed and make some recommendations for future aid.³³ This book was published in 2006, and those recommendations were not followed.

Killing with Kindness: Haiti, International Aid, and NGOs, does an excellent job describing the International Aid received by the governmental in Haiti, and how this aid often fails to get where it needs to go, especially with undue pressure from NGOs. This book focuses on two NGOs providing aid, one private and one public, showing the different abilities and challenges afforded by the donors of the aid.³⁴

Despite all of the literature on Haiti, there has really been little emphasis on the lack of recent progress in Haiti. With the exception of a few community-based NGOs, there have been few success stories, even with additional economic assistance from disaster relief. The question remains: why are so many Haitians living in poverty despite the billions of dollars of developmental aid Haiti has received?

D. POTENTIAL EXPLANATIONS AND HYPOTHESES

It seems clear that the developmental aid received by the Haitian government is not resulting in discernable benefit to the Haitians. I will review hypotheses that are put forward to explain this failure. These hypotheses center on governmental corruption, profiteering by the companies sent in to aid in Haiti's recovery, and inappropriate use of aid by the Haitian recipients.

³² Buss and Gardner, *Haiti in the Balance*, 187–188.

³³ Ibid., 88–105.

³⁴ Mark Schuller, *Killing With Kindness: Haiti, International Aid, and NGOs*, (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 2012).

The first hypothesis is that governmental corruption is responsible for the lack of progress. Haiti has a long history of inefficient use of international aid; this appears to be just another example. A recent Congressional Research Service report lays out the challenges facing the Haitian governmental system very well. The report states the Haitian government under current President Martelly has made fighting government corruption the number one priority and has made some progress; however, “corruption remains rife at all levels,” according to U.N. Human Rights expert Michel Frost, just prior to his resignation in March 2013.³⁵ The report notes the relative inexperience of President Martelly and his cabinet, as well as the legislative and judicial branches, stating specifically that “this is the first time in 25 years that Haiti has had those three branches of government in place.”³⁶ With a high number of inexperienced leaders placed in positions of power and obtaining access to resources, governmental corruption is difficult to rule out, especially given Haiti’s past governmental regimes. Although this is a compelling proposition, there are alternative explanations.

Another hypothesis was proposed by Laura Zanotti’s “Cacophonies of Aid, Failed State Building, and NGOs in Haiti: Setting the Stage for Disaster, Envisioning the Future.” She proposes that privileged NGOs manipulated the Haitian government, playing on their naivety, in order to siphon off human and capital resources from the state, jeopardizing the building of sustainable national infrastructure.³⁷ Zanotti does acknowledge how some honest NGOs were able to make positive impacts in Haiti, but the actions of some of the major international NGOs negatively affected the local economy, as well as the ability of the government to provide durable and consistent services to the population.³⁸

The third and final hypothesis to be explored is the idea that once the aid got to the Haitian people it was squandered and misused. A recent article published by Robert

³⁵ Taft-Morales, *Haiti under President Martelly: Current Conditions and Congressional Concerns*, 8–9.

³⁶ Ibid., 8.

³⁷ Laura Zanotti, “Cacophonies of Aid, Failed State Building and NGOs in Haiti,” *Third World*, 768.

³⁸ Ibid.

Looney highlights the recent success of web-based companies that are committed to helping the poor and eliminating poverty. The two companies highlighted are Zafen, which provides interest-free loans to entrepreneurs, and Fonkoze, Haiti's largest microfinance institution that delivers the loans from Zafen.³⁹ The findings by Looney serve to reinforce the idea that the Haitians are proud and independent, preferring to work for a better life than wait for their government to take care of them. These promising indicators in the private sector may form the foundation for future economic growth and expansion in Haiti, increasing the stability of the country.

Yet, Gibbons, through her observations of Haitian culture, documents how "control over a scarce resource can produce power if those who need the resource believe that it is critical and without substitutes."⁴⁰ She uses the example of a government depository librarian that would store blueprints of different floors of the same building in separate places that only she knew where to find them to make her indispensable.⁴¹ This article indicates that instead of being willing to work together for a common good, some Haitians are only working to serve their own self-interests, even in the aftermath of a natural disaster.

Responsible utilization of resources is a challenge in a country like Haiti. From governmental oversight to the NGOs delivering the aid to the recipients, ensuring fair and equitable distribution tests the moral integrity of those involved that could profit from taking advantage of their position. When growth stagnates, each level is subject to examination to determine which step is the most likely place that something went wrong.

E. RESEARCH DESIGN

This thesis will examine the use of developmental aid in Haiti focusing on the past five years. Haiti will be treated as a single case study due to its unique political and economic development. The political history of Haiti will have to be explored to explain the foundation of current Haitian politics. Similarly, the economic decline and stagnation

³⁹ Robert E. Looney, "Finally, Good News From Haiti," 1.

⁴⁰ Gibbons, "Haiti: Cultural and Social Aspects," 6.

⁴¹ Ibid.

of Haiti will also need to be uncovered in order to understand the current economic situation.

Once the historical framework is established, I will focus on Haiti's recent history. President Martelly was given additional aid in the wake of the 2010 earthquake to ease the poverty, bring relief to the victims, and grow Haiti's infrastructure. I will look at why that has seemingly failed to take place or at least why the progress has been slower than expected.

Finally, this study will show how a volatile Haiti presents a security challenge for the United States. Haiti is a nation that has required United States intervention to return to stability in the past. Further corruption and misuse of aid can potentially result in another intervention. With its proximity to the United States, the relative success of its neighbors, and an ability to produce exportable goods, Haiti seems to have the potential to return to prosperity; because it has failed to do so indicates underlying causes that are worth exploring.

For the purposes of information and data gathering, I will primarily rely on secondary sources, particularly for the historical, background information, as they offer a more objective analysis of the political and economic history of Haiti. I will also use some government reports as primary sources, especially while trying to assess the effectiveness of the current Haitian government.

F. OVERVIEW AND FINDINGS

This thesis will consist of four chapters. The first chapter will begin with an overview of the relevance and benefits of the study of developmental assistance in Haiti. It will discuss the general background information found in literature about the amounts and types of developmental assistance provided to Haiti. It will conclude with an introduction to the organization of the rest of the thesis and the methods that will be used to evaluate the effectiveness of developmental assistance efforts.

The second chapter will focus on the evolution of governmental leadership and economic progress in Haiti. This chapter will begin by discussing how Haiti became

prosperous as a French colony and how the economy collapsed following Haiti's independence. It will continue by discussing the governmental struggles over the next 100 years until the United States occupied Haiti in 1915 and provided some stability to the Haitian government. The chapter will conclude with the end of the United States occupation until the end of the Aristide regime in 2004. This section will include portions on François ("Papa Doc") Duvalier, Jean-Claude ("Baby Doc") Duvalier, the Military Junta from 1991–1994, and both of Jean-Bertrand Aristide's terms in office. The Duvalier's reign, the junta, and President Aristide's time in office are the most influential factors in shaping the current Haitian government.

The third chapter will present an evaluation of the three hypotheses. This chapter will begin with a summary of reliance on foreign aid prior to the 2010 earthquake. The chapter will continue with the explanation of the disbursement of aid received since the 2010 earthquake and the plans for funds committed to Haitian development and recovery that have not yet been received. It will continue by discussing the Haitian government under current President Michel Martelly. It will continue with an analysis of NGO operations and accountability in properly distributing aid to the Haitians. This chapter will conclude by analyzing how the Haitian citizens are utilizing the aid once it was received.

The final chapter will summarize the use of the developmental assistance Haiti received and present an analysis of the ineffectiveness of that assistance. It will present the progress made in Haiti as a result of these contributions and make recommendations for future assistance. Very few countries have received as much developmental aid as Haiti has, especially in the Western Hemisphere. Even with all of the aid received, Haiti is still bordering on becoming a failed state. This chapter will contend that Haiti's inability to prosper is a result of influential NGOs manipulating the governmental leadership at the expense of the impoverished Haitian masses.

With a long, proud history of independence, as well as poverty, the Haitian people are unlikely to either look for or accept any long term outside intervention in the way Haiti's government is run; however, it is in the best interest of the United States to ensure

that the developmental aid Haiti receives is being used responsibly so that Haiti can become a stable nation and economic trading partner and not a security concern.

II. HAITI'S GOVERNMENT AND ECONOMY

Haiti has a population of nearly 10 million people with the vast majority being extremely poor with a small minority that is extremely wealthy. Even though over 90 percent of Haitians are of African descent, this demographic possesses little economic or political power.⁴² Despite recent efforts made to increase the level of education in Haiti, the literacy rate of the peasant population is the lowest in the Western Hemisphere and among the lowest in the world.⁴³ The Haitian mulatto elite are wealthy, cultivated, and cosmopolitan even though they make up less than 3 percent of the population.⁴⁴ The elite class rarely seeks political election, but they use their economic influence to control those that are elected. Haiti also has a small middle class consisting primarily of immigrants, which has had a negligible effect on the political and economic landscape in Haiti.⁴⁵

After centuries of squalor and mismanagement, Haiti is now considered a fragile state, and it is on the verge of becoming a failed nation state. Haiti quickly went from being the most profitable colony in the Western hemisphere to its current, deplorable state after achieving independence from France over 200 years ago. Understanding why Haiti failed to recover can best be explained by examining the history of the Haitian government and economy.

A. SPANISH RULE: 1492–1697

On his first voyage to the Americas in 1492, Christopher Columbus landed on Haiti's northern coast. Columbus called the Island "Ysla Española," which quickly became the Latinized version, Hispaniola. According to Columbus, the natives were "lovable, tractable, peaceable, gentle, [and] decorous." The native population existed in

⁴² Samuel E. Finer, *The Man on Horseback: The Role of the Military in Politics*, (Transaction Publishers, 2003), 132.

⁴³ *The World Factbook*, CIA, <https://www.cia.gov/library/publications/the-world-factbook/fields/2103.html>, 136.

⁴⁴ *Ibid.*, 132.

⁴⁵ *Ibid.*

communal societies that worked together for the survival of their populations. There was no discernable external trade or commerce. Columbus also described the natives as completely defenseless, cowardly, and lacking military skills but aptly fit to take orders and do work. In the opinion of the Spanish, Hispaniola was just an island of gold and slaves.⁴⁶

Before departing Hispaniola, one of Columbus' ships, the *Santa María*, hit a coral reef off Cap Haïten, forcing him to leave a settlement of forty volunteers. The initial settlement would never be seen again; after returning, Columbus would find "nothing but ruins and carcasses where he had left fortifications and Spaniards."⁴⁷ This would be the first documented example of Haitians resisting foreign occupation. Upon his return, Columbus established another settlement on the southeast coast of Hispaniola called *Isabella*, which Spain developed into a colony that later became Santo Domingo. This colony became a staging point for expeditions and provided supplies for Spanish conquistadors.⁴⁸

The Spaniards forced the natives into slave labor under the guidance of Bartholomew Columbus who was the first governor of Hispaniola and the brother of Christopher Columbus. The initial population of Hispaniola was estimated to be around 3 million people, although this number was likely exaggerated. The native population was reduced to barely 60,000 by the time a census was conducted in 1508. The number shrank to 14,000 by 1514; and there were only 600 natives in 1533. In 1550, there were only 150 native Indians left. The local slave labor was unsustainable in Hispaniola due to epidemics and enslavement from the Spanish colony.⁴⁹

The need for workers resulted in the import of a large amount of slave labor from Africa. The majority were Bantus from Angola and Congo. There were also many Guineans. The Senegalese were rare but prized for their height and warlike nature. The

⁴⁶ Heintz and Heintz, *Written in Blood*, 11–12.

⁴⁷ Ibid., 12.

⁴⁸ Ibid.

⁴⁹ Heintz and Heintz, *Written in Blood*, 13.

loss of the indigenous population and inflow of Africans gave Hispaniola a mixed population dominated by European whites, African blacks, and mulattoes, with only an insignificant remaining native population.⁵⁰

African slaves were much more productive than their Indian counterparts, but they also fought slavery and sought opportunities for freedom much more proactively. The first official Africans arrived in Hispaniola in 1502 although there were already some in Hispaniola, possibly brought by Columbus himself. By 1503, the slaves started to steal from their masters and run away in gangs into the mountains, called “*marronage*.” These actions of independence and indignation would create a culture that would be repeated throughout Haiti’s history.⁵¹

In the mid-1500s, Spain moved its administrative center from Santo Domingo to Mexico after the conquest and the establishment of New Spain. Despite modest gold deposits discovered on the initial landing, Hispaniola was quickly depleted of its gold reserves. Mexico and Peru offered the gold the Spanish explorers were after; Hispaniola had plantations of sugar, coffee, tobacco, and cotton but no precious metals. Spain focused more attention elsewhere in the new world and essentially abandoned the western third of Hispaniola.⁵²

During the late 1500s, French, Dutch, and British forces increasingly threatened naval superiority over the Spanish navy, which made protecting weak colonies like Santo Domingo from pirates even more difficult. Complicating matters, French and British merchants would arrive in Spanish ports and illegally undersell Spanish merchants. In response, the King of Spain placed a rigorous embargo on Hispaniola dismantling all ports except the port in Santo Domingo. The result was disastrous for the inhabitants of Hispaniola. The colonists that stayed were left poor and idle, mostly living off the land in homes without furniture and without clothes. During this period, Spain demonstrated an

⁵⁰ Heintz and Heintz, *Written in Blood*, 10–12.

⁵¹ *Ibid.*, 13.

⁵² Patrick Bellegarde-Smith, *Haiti: The Breached Citadel* (San Francisco: Westview Press, 1990), 6.

unwillingness to take care of its colony or citizens, which only increased the opportunity for a future revolt.⁵³

French Huguenots from the neighboring island of Tortuga began to settle what would later become Haiti during the mid-1600s, realizing the value of the island was in the fertile soil and the people that tended it. The Spanish were focused on seeking gold elsewhere and had already demonstrated little interest in creating and protecting colonies that failed to produce gold. From 1630–1659 Western Hispaniola would change hands several times among the English, Dutch, and French. In 1659, King Charles II of Spain relinquished control of the western portion of Hispaniola to Louis XIV as royal governor. This would begin 130 years of French dominion in Haiti, which the French named St. Domingue.⁵⁴

B. FRENCH RULE: 1697–1791

During the 1700s, the French colony of Haiti grew and prospered. Haiti was producing over half of the coffee in the world and 40 percent of the sugar for France and Britain. It accounted for 40 percent of France's trade when France was the most dominant economy in Europe. Haiti was able to achieve prosperity but only through slavery. Prior to the French Revolution, there were an estimated 500 to 700 thousand slaves in Haiti, primarily from the west central region of African. The mortality rate in Haiti was very high due to the rigorous demands of plantation labor in addition to the epidemics endemic to the region.⁵⁵

White slaveholders dominated the African slave population for over a century. As a result, a subpopulation of mulattoes was created between the white male masters and the African women. These offspring of white elite were granted special privileges that allowed them to accumulate some land and wealth. The mulattoes occupied a distinct

⁵³ Heintz and Heintz, *Written in Blood*, 13–14.

⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, 15–16.

⁵⁵ *Ibid.*, 25, 32.

social class definitely inferior to the white social elites but holding considerably more rights than the pure African slaves.⁵⁶

The end of the 18th century was a dynamic time in the Western World, with the American Revolution and the French Revolution both directly influencing Haiti. Until 1776, there had not been a successful colonial revolt. The independence achieved by the United States planted the idea among Haitians that a revolution against a remote colonial power was possible. Prior to the French Revolution, the idea of a revolt in Haiti seemed unlikely due to the power and influence France had over the small island nation. All Haiti had known since the arrival of Columbus was an existence of slavery and colonial rule. Any thoughts of an uprising would be quelled by reinforcements from France; however, while the French Revolution was taking place in mainland France, the Haitian colonists were largely left to fend for themselves.

C. THE HAITIAN REVOLUTION: 1791–1804

In 1791, a faction of African leaders initiated a slave rebellion changing the political landscape in Haiti. The initial revolt in northern Haiti was unsuccessful resulting in two thousand whites massacred, ten thousand blacks killed, and the destruction of approximately one thousand plantations.⁵⁷ These actions incited further rebellions of mulattoes in southern and western Haiti.

Haiti remained under French control. The French National Assembly decreed that Haiti would grant equal rights to the mulattoes.⁵⁸ Instead of easing tensions, this edict created a division between the white Haitians that accepted the decisions of the revolutionaries in Paris and those that rejected them. The Haitian Revolution devolved into a melee with regional conflicts between black slaves and white masters, mulattoes

⁵⁶ Heintz and Heintz, *Written in Blood*, 26.

⁵⁷ *Ibid.*, 46.

⁵⁸ Franklin W. Knight, "The Haitian Revolution," *American Historical Review* 105, no. 1 (2000): 111.

against white administrators, and black royalists against the white republicans and the mulatto republicans.⁵⁹

Francois-Dominique Toussaint Louverture was an integral leader of the Haitian Revolution that would shape the future of Haiti. Toussaint was a black slave to a family that provided him with an education. At a young age, he was inspired by the writings of Raynal and the prophesy of a “black Spartacus,” which Toussaint aspired to become. After arranging for the departure of his master’s family from Haiti, Toussaint joined the rebellion and quickly rose to positions of prominence as one of the few black leaders that could read and write.⁶⁰

The uprising ended in April 1793 at *Cap Francais* when the Republican French forces, aided by thousands of blacks, defeated the white royalists. As a reward for their service, the black recruits were awarded their freedom. The republican French administrator of Haiti would abolish slavery for the entire country in August 1793.⁶¹

Haiti was in upheaval with France still maintaining a tenuous ability to govern the nation. Even though the royalists had been defeated, not all of the rebellion leaders elected to join the republican French administrators of Haiti. Toussaint was one of the three rebellion leaders that committed their support to representatives of the Spanish King in Santo Domingo.⁶² The Spanish authorities provided supplies for two armies led by black Haitians, including one by Toussaint himself; however, he switched his allegiance back to the French Republicans after Spain failed to deliver on its promise of abolishing slavery in the territory it had captured.⁶³

France and Spain signed a treaty in July 1794 that returned the western part of Hispaniola that Spain had occupied to France.⁶⁴ As a result, Spain no longer provided

⁵⁹ Laurent Dubois, *Avengers of the New World: The Story of the Haitian Revolution* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2004), 25.

⁶⁰ Ibid., 172.

⁶¹ Laurent Dubois, *Haiti: The Aftershocks of History* (New York: Metropolitan Books, 2012), 28.

⁶² Heintz and Heintz, *Written in Blood*, 64.

⁶³ Dubois, *Avengers of the New World*, 178–179.

⁶⁴ Ibid., 183.

supplies to black royalist troops in Haiti, leading them to disband and join forces with Toussaint.⁶⁵

In 1796, French Republican troops faced another uprising, but Toussaint intervened, uniting the whites, blacks, and mulattoes, to peaceably settle the dispute.⁶⁶ In recognition of his stature and appreciation for his actions, he was appointed as the lieutenant governor of Haiti. He would later be promoted to the commander of all French forces in Haiti. Toussaint appointed a mulatto commander, Rigaud, to further secure the allegiance of the mulatto forces. Allegiance being erratic in Haiti, he would later negotiate a truce with the British forces and expel the French commissioner. In 1800, Rigaud's forces rebelled against Toussaint but were soundly defeated. Rigaud left in exile allowing Toussaint to successfully consolidate his power over all of Hispaniola. When Haiti released its new constitution in 1801, Toussaint was declared governor-general for life.⁶⁷

As much as Toussaint was regarded as a hero in Haiti, he was considered a villain in France. Napoleon Bonaparte sent between 16 and 20 thousand troops to Haiti in 1802 to regain control of the island.⁶⁸ Aided by white and mulatto troops, the French forces attrited Toussaint's army forcing him to surrender. Toussaint was taken to France as a prisoner and died in jail soon after.⁶⁹

The regained French rule would not last long in Haiti. Napoleon restored slavery, which incited Haitian leaders to rebel against France. France also got into another war with Britain. To fund the war, France sold Louisiana to the United States, eliminating the strategic importance of holding Haiti. Napoleon withdrew his military assets from Haiti,

⁶⁵ Dubois, *Avengers of the New World*, 180–181.

⁶⁶ Ibid., 190.

⁶⁷ Heintz and Heintz, *Written in Blood*, 74–77.

⁶⁸ Ibid., 100.

⁶⁹ Dubois, *Avengers of the New World*, 296–297.

which left control of Haiti in the hands of Haitian General Jean-Jacques Dessalines. Haiti declared its independence from France on January 1, 1804.⁷⁰

Independence came at a high cost for Haiti. Slaves were granted freedom from tyranny, but the economic controls put in place by the French would cease to exist. The greater cost would begin to be realized in 1825 when the Haitian government agreed to pay indemnity to the French planters for the lost land and slaves during the revolution. The substantial debt now owed to France would economically cripple Haiti from that point forward.⁷¹

D. POST-REVOLUTION HAITI: 1804–1915

As leader of the Haitian forces and hero of the Revolution, General Dessalines declared himself Emperor of Haiti in September 1804. Haiti ratified its constitution on May 20, 1805, which declared Dessalines emperor for life and gave him the right to name his successor.⁷²

Toussaint and Dessalines were very distinctly different leaders. Toussaint rose to prominence as the liberator of Haiti; he sought liberty and unification. He worked to rebuild Haiti's infrastructure, revitalizing commerce, developing administration, and rebuilding the road system. Dessalines came as the invader with the primary focus of remove every last influence the French had remaining in Haiti.⁷³

Dessalines' leadership over Haiti was characterized by massive human rights violations and failed attempts at progress. His most defining act was the 1804 Haiti Massacre where between February and April 1804 Dessalines had all of the whites living in Haiti killed. Dessalines was born into slavery, served a white master for 30 years, and seen many atrocities. He did not trust the whites, particularly the French. Afterwards, Dessalines declared Haiti an all-black nation and whites were forbidden from owning

⁷⁰ Dubois, *Avengers of the New World*, 303–304.

⁷¹ Ibid., 303.

⁷² Heintz and Heintz, *Written in Blood*, 134.

⁷³ Ibid.

property or land in Haiti. Although this decision was a cornerstone of the newly formed culture of Haiti, it would restrict economic opportunities for the nation for centuries. Haiti still resists allowing whites to immigrate to Haiti and owning and operating business in the country over 200 years later.⁷⁴

As drastic and grotesque as the Haiti Massacre was, this measure served several purposes. First, it was retribution for not only the wrongs committed against Dessalines himself but also all of human rights violations carried out by the white colonists against the blacks in Haiti since Columbus landed in 1492. Second, it sent a message to France that Haiti is no longer a French colony. There were no longer any ties to France; that period of Haitian history had ended.

Dessalines faced substantial challenges in trying to keep the sugar industry running and plantation crops producing after slavery was abolished in Haiti. Although merchants from Britain and the United States were welcomed, foreign trade was tightly regulated. Dessalines resorted to harsh treatment of plantation labor. All blacks were required to work either as soldiers or on the plantations. Enforcing this directive, many blacks felt they were still enslaved, realizing little difference between the Haiti under French rule or that of Dessalines.⁷⁵

The Dessalines administration needed literate and educated people to be national officials and manage national affairs. At the time, the only well-educated Haitians were disproportionately the light-skinned elite, known as *gens de couleur*. Although there was really no alternative, this decision reintroduced a racially divided, class warfare into the newly formed Haiti.⁷⁶

Dessalines died October 17, 1806. Although the details are uncertain, he did not die of natural causes. As the first leader of an independent Haiti, Dessalines set several precedents that would become engrained in Haiti's culture. First, he declared himself ruler for life and was allowed to appoint his successor without a democratic election.

⁷⁴ Dubois, *Avengers of the New World*, 298–301.

⁷⁵ Heintz and Heintz, *Written in blood*, 134–135.

⁷⁶ *Ibid.*, 135–136.

Although the constitution would limit terms of future governors to five year terms, instead of setting the precedent and establishing a democratic election process himself, Dessalines put himself above the constitution. Had Haiti introduced the democratic process from the beginning, following the example of the United States, Haiti's government may have adopted the democratic process and replaced their elected Presidents through term expiration instead of forcibly removing him. Second, Dessalines used force and human rights violations to consolidate his power. This was a dangerous precedent set that has been repeated throughout Haiti's history. Finally, Dessalines created an elite class that was separate from the ethnic majority of the population. Haiti would struggle economically without slavery, forcing the masses into poverty and allowing the elites to determine where and how any aid money gets spent. The creation of this elite class may be the most important lasting legacy of the Dessalines era.

E. UNITED STATES MILITARY INTERVENTION IN HAITI AND AFTERMATH: 1915–1957

Between 1804 and 1915, Haiti had 26 presidents. Out of these first 26 presidents, only one would complete his full term; everyone else was either overthrown or died in office.⁷⁷ There was no stability or continuity within the Haitian government, and there were no economic successes to support the nation. The great wealth previously found in Haiti was destroyed during the war of independence and what remained gradually deteriorated due to neglect.⁷⁸ Independent subsistence farming replaced large-scale agriculture. Despite the efforts of the government to maintain the economy, plantations were abandoned; sugar mills, roads, aqueducts, and irrigation systems brought by the French deteriorated from lack of use. Although the infrastructure was in place, Haitian peasants were content doing subsistence farming and were unenthusiastic about working for wages.⁷⁹

⁷⁷ See Appendix.

⁷⁸ Hans Schmidt, *The United States Occupation of Haiti, 1915–1934*, (New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1971), 24.

⁷⁹ Ibid.

Due to Haiti's location, it could serve as a strategic potential naval base for either the United States or any other imperialist power looking to exploit Haiti's instability. As early as 1868, the annexation of both Haiti and the Dominican Republic was suggested by President Andrew Johnson in order to secure an economic stake in the West Indies as well as preventing foreign occupation. At the end of the 19th century, the United States unsuccessfully tried to lease one of Haiti's northern cities, Mole-Saint Nicolas, as a naval base. The United States also tried economic intervention, offering a large loan in 1910 in hopes that Haiti could reduce the amount of foreign influence it faced by paying off its international debt. Due to the size of the debt and the instability of the country, the attempt was futile.⁸⁰

The United States was working hard to eliminate foreign influence in the Caribbean, using the Spanish-American War to expel the Spanish and occupying Cuba twice between 1900 and 1910.⁸¹ The United States was using the Monroe Doctrine to ensure there would be no European Intervention in the Caribbean. The instability in the Haitian government was becoming a crisis as seven presidents were assassinated or overthrown in Haiti between 1911 and 1915.⁸² The instability in Haiti was a great concern for the United States and was also the object of foreign aspirations, particularly of the Germans and French.⁸³

In July 1915, the United States invaded Haiti and held the island nation under military occupation for 19 years. During this occupation, Haiti underwent a drastic transformation. Haiti was forced into ratifying a new constitution, the legislature was dissolved, a president favorable to the United States was elected through manipulated elections, and the Haitian military was reorganized and restructured in the mold of the

⁸⁰ U.S. Department of State, *Milestones: 1914–1920: U.S. Invasion and Occupation of Haiti, 1915–1934*, Office of the Historian, <https://history.state.gov/milestones/1914–1920/haiti>.

⁸¹ Heinl and Heinl, *Written in blood*, 350.

⁸² U.S. Department of State, *Milestones: 1914–1920*.

⁸³ Heinl and Heinl, *Written in blood*, 350–351.

United States Marines. American officials commandeered Haiti's finances in an effort to address Haiti's debt more efficiently.⁸⁴

The United States intervention was met with mixed results. Some of the Haitian elite initially cooperated with the Americans, while many other elites were much more cautious and unwilling to join forces. There was also a group called *Cacos* that formed an armed insurgency. Initially small and insignificant, the *Cacos* grew as the population increasingly rebelled against the United States occupation.⁸⁵

There were several causes of the dissention between the Haitians and Americans. At the peasant level, the newly formed Haitian military was racially segregating the population, censoring the press, and coercing them into forced labor to meet the economic expectations of the Americans.⁸⁶ At the highest levels was the unwillingness of the American marines to distinguish between the Haitian elites and peasants. The elite class took pride in keeping their Western orientation and tried to emulate refined white western culture. The marines made no distinction between blacks or mulattoes or between the educated or uneducated and instead treated all Haitians as Negroes. The elites, shocked and insulted, turned to the black African heritage of the masses. This was a sort of reawakening of black ethnical awareness in Haiti.⁸⁷

Out of adversity arose opportunity. François Duvalier took the opportunity to write articles on Haitian ethnology and emerged as a champion of Black Nationalism. Duvalier's writings bridged the gap between the government and the masses challenging Haiti since French colonialism. Haiti still faced political and economic challenges, but they were now united, and the enemy was the United States.⁸⁸

The United States tried to give an American solution to a Haitian problem. Even though the Haitian solution was obviously not working, the Haitian people were not

⁸⁴ Mary A. Renda, *Taking Haiti: Military Occupation and the Culture of U.S. Imperialism, 1915–1934*, (Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2001), 10.

⁸⁵ *Ibid.*, 10–11.

⁸⁶ U.S. Department of State, *Milestones: 1914–1920*.

⁸⁷ Schmidt, *The United States Occupation of Haiti*, 23.

⁸⁸ *Ibid.*

going to accept an external solution to their problem. Complicating the situation was the lack of empathy shown by the occupying force and a lack of appreciation for the complexity of the situation to think that it could be solved in a relatively expedient manner using force and intimidation. A series of strikes and uprisings in 1929 led the United States to start withdrawing forces from Haiti, which set the stage for an official withdrawal in 1934 under President Franklin D. Roosevelt's Good Neighbor Policy.⁸⁹

When the United States departed Haiti, it was treated as a second independence. Unlike 1804, however, in 1934 Haiti was much more suited for success. When Haiti initially gained independence, it was wrecked and ravaged by war. Few nations in history had ever been less prepared for nationhood than Haiti. In 1934, Haiti had a functioning bureaucracy, a disciplined apolitical military force, and an incumbent administration of educated men constitutionally elected, as opposed to the appointed former slaves that came to power following the previous independence.⁹⁰

As many parallels as there were between Haiti's two independences, the more apt comparisons come from the condition of the country twenty-three years later. Sadly, the Haiti of 1957 would be very similar to the Haiti of 1827. As Heintz accounts:

*In 1827, Haiti was in general ruin with fields of dead crops; the inherited infrastructure from the French, including roads and bridges, were gone; the cities were ruined; the seaports were closed or decayed; the economy was at a standstill; the army was in miserable deterioration; political institutions were deadlocked; and there was a race war between the blacks and mulattoes.*⁹¹

Just like in the early 1800s, the progress of the mid-1930s had disappeared by the mid-1950s. Roads and bridges built by the Americans no longer existed. Agricultural exports, Haiti's main exports, had dropped 20 percent in the past decade and were still in decline. The phone system no longer worked. Ports were not maintained. The inlets were filled with silt. The ports lacked lighting and became obstructed with shipwrecks. The

⁸⁹ U.S. Department of State, *Milestones: 1914–1920*.

⁹⁰ Heintz and Heintz, *Written in blood*, 516.

⁹¹ *Ibid.*, 585.

docks were rotting. Sanitation and electrification were in gross decline. The military and political institutions were in disarray. There were bitter conflicts among the classes, races, and political regimes. Newly elected President François Duvalier remarked that Haiti was “rotting in poverty, hunger, nudity, sickness, and illiteracy.”⁹²

F. THE DUVALIERIST REGIMES: 1957–1986

The legacy of the Duvalierist regimes would be one of terror and political consolidation, as well as a return to the “négritude” of Haiti. When François Duvalier was elected President of Haiti in 1957, Haiti once again had a chance to rewrite its’ history; however, the man that Haiti elected president was not the man he appeared to be. François Duvalier was always well dressed in a formal and conservative manner. He was a soft-spoken, black physician of only five-feet-six inches and 150 pounds that had studied in America. Duvalier was greatly dedicated to Haiti’s history and folk culture, including a strict dedication to the traditional practices of Haiti’s Voodoo religion.⁹³

Since achieving independence, Haitians have given nicknames to their leaders. Duvalier was different. He titled himself “Papa Doc.”⁹⁴ This would be an indication of the imposition of his will on the Haitian people as well as providing the people a kind mask to place on a terrorist. Duvalier ran on a reformist platform, but he would become another one of many Haitian politicians that would promise the peasant the most and deliver him the least.⁹⁵

During his campaign, he was thought to be a fool and the military regarded him as a puppet that could be easily manipulated.⁹⁶ Despite his perceived ineptitude, he was backed by the United States as the most middle-of-the-road reformer and the best

⁹² Heintz and Heintz, *Written in blood*, 585.

⁹³ *Ibid.*, 586.

⁹⁴ Bernard Diederich and Al Burt, *Papa Doc: The Truth About Haiti Today* (New York: McGraw-Hill, 1969), 11.

⁹⁵ *Ibid.*, 101.

⁹⁶ *Ibid.*, 77–78.

candidate.⁹⁷ In less than a decade after becoming president, he would be known primarily for his brutality and greed, which made Haiti even worse than Castro's Communist Cuba.⁹⁸

Duvalier had a particularly complex personality, marked by extreme paranoia that resulted in mistrust and, above everything else, a need for violence.⁹⁹ Some of his paranoia was justified. Like many Haitian presidents, he was the target of bomb explosions, terrorism, strikes, conspiracies, and invasions of the presidential palace.¹⁰⁰ His response was much more extreme than his predecessors, using the police and military to protect the president against the "enemies of the nation," which was any Haitian that opposed the views of Duvalier.¹⁰¹

Soon after election, Duvalier would create a secret police force called the *cagoulauds*, which would eventually become the notorious Tonton Macoutes.¹⁰² This group was assigned the activities that Duvalier did not want linked back to him. Duvalier's violence was swift and efficient. During his regime, he effectively eliminated all of his competition through violent intimidation.¹⁰³

Duvalier also prioritized the return of *négritude* in Haiti. He believed that Haiti should embrace its African origin and reject the overtures of assimilation into Euro-American cultures.¹⁰⁴ Duvalier would later be criticized by the founder of *négritude* for his interpretation as a conflict between races instead of between the ruling class and the masses. Despite his outward stance on *négritude*, Duvalier violated his own principles by including several mulattoes in prominent positions in his cabinet.¹⁰⁵

⁹⁷ Jerbi, *Political Parties and Democracy in Haiti*, 38–39.

⁹⁸ Diederich and Burt, *Papa Doc*, 11–12.

⁹⁹ Heintz and Heintz, *Written in blood*, 587.

¹⁰⁰ Diederich and Burt, *Papa Doc*, 96–97.

¹⁰¹ *Ibid.*, 99–100.

¹⁰² *Ibid.*, 102.

¹⁰³ Jerbi, *Political Parties and Democracy in Haiti*, 39.

¹⁰⁴ Heintz and Heintz, *Written in blood*, 587.

¹⁰⁵ Diederich and Burt, *Papa Doc*, 388.

After consolidating his power and eliminating all competition, Duvalier declared himself “President-for-Life” in 1964. Upon his death in April 1971, his son and personally designated successor, Jean-Claude “Baby Doc” Duvalier, became president. Baby Doc would continue to terrorize and politically oppress the Haitian people throughout his reign, although to a lesser extent than his father.¹⁰⁶

Jean-Claude Duvalier not only curbed some of the violent actions that characterized his father’s reign, but he also was able to make some economic advances, particularly in the early years of his time in power. Agricultural production increased, capital investment grew, and tourism improved, resulting in a real growth in the economy of 5 percent per year and gaining favorable assessments from the United States.¹⁰⁷

Despite his economic success, Baby Doc lacked the connection to the Haitian people his father had developed. Duvalier had spent most of his life in the presidential palace and was accustomed to the privileges of being the leader of the Haitian elite. He did little to mask his profiteering, allocating hundreds of millions of dollars to private bank accounts and affording his a lavish lifestyle at the expense of his people. Making matters worse, he revived the mulatto influence in Haiti selecting a mulatto wife and bringing in high level technological experts that opened Haiti to the Euro-American culture his father tried to limit. By the early 1980s, he had lost the support of the black middle class and had to rely on the support of the business community.¹⁰⁸

While Haiti’s economy improved throughout the 1970’s, Baby Doc was tolerated and even embraced as president; however, as economic conditions began to decline, his political standing also declined. When Pope John Paul II condemned the Duvalier regime in 1983, the people rebelled.¹⁰⁹ Although it would take several years to remove him

¹⁰⁶ Jerbi, *Political Parties and Democracy in Haiti*, 40.

¹⁰⁷ David Nichols, “Haiti: The Rise and Fall of Duvalierism,” *Third World Quarterly* 8, no. 4 (1986): 1241.

¹⁰⁸ *Ibid.*, 1241–1242.

¹⁰⁹ “From Duvalier to Avril, 1957–89,” Library of Congress, accessed June 17, 2014, <http://countrystudies.us/haiti/65.htm>.

from office, President Duvalier went into exile in 1986 ending the Duvalier reign in Haiti. During this era, an estimated 20,000 to 50,000 Haitians were murdered.¹¹⁰

G. ARISTIDE AND HAITI'S TRANSITION TO DEMOCRACY: 1986–2010

A transitional government supported by the military provided order until elections were held in December 1990. Due to the political oppression of the Duvalier regimes, it took time for political parties to become established. There were several cancelled elections due to undue military influence and voter manipulation until a legitimate, democratic election could take place.

The leading candidate and American choice, Jean-Bertrand Aristide, was a liberation theology Roman Catholic priest. He was selected by 67% of the voters in elections that international observers believed to be largely free and fair. Despite his popularity among the masses, Aristide's radical populist policies and the violence of his bands of supporters upset the elite class.¹¹¹ In September 1991, Aristide was overthrown and forced into exile, first fleeing to Venezuela and later to the United States.¹¹²

This began another period of instability in Haiti. Although Joseph Nerette was granted the title of Provincial President, this seemingly was more of a formality; military leader General Raul Cédras was generally viewed as Haiti's leader. While Haiti's president would change several times during Aristide's exile, General Cédras would be a constant. During this period, there was severe violence and economic hardship.

The coup also created a large increase in the number of refugees fleeing Haiti. The close proximity to Florida, large Haitian diaspora, and vast opportunities made the United States an ideal destination. Volumes were high at the onset of the coup, briefly subsided, and increased as the months went on, particularly after Bill Clinton was elected

¹¹⁰ Jerbi, *Political Parties and Democracy in Haiti*, 40.

¹¹¹ "Operation Uphold Democracy," GlobalSecurity.org, accessed June 2, 2014, http://www.globalsecurity.org/military/ops/uphold_democracy.htm.

¹¹² Ibid.

President in 1993. The high number of migrants added pressure for the United States to intervene in Haiti. Eventually, the United States would intervene in Haiti, executing Operation Uphold Democracy, which successfully returned President Aristide to power without combat and allowed him to finish the remainder of his term as president.¹¹³

The success of Operation Uphold Democracy allowed President Aristide to return from exile in 1994 and gave Haitians a renewed hope for the future. Upon resuming his office as president, Aristide disbanded the military. Since the military had successfully executed numerous coups throughout Haiti's history, the reaction was not completely irrational. The military had also been responsible for persecuting political opposition and undermining party institutionalization, impeding the democratic process.¹¹⁴ In the larger view of international politics, this decision is potentially problematic. A national military is essential in ensuring the sovereignty of a state. Without a standing military, Haiti has no means of defense from outside invasions. Based on Haiti's past, it should be able to create a formidable militia of conscripts if the need should arise. Since this policy was adopted in 1994, the absence of a standing military has not been an issue in Haiti. Another concern is that the military was the only reliable way for blacks to increase their socioeconomic status in Haiti. Removing the military has eliminated these opportunities for advancement as well as further reducing the number of jobs available in Haiti.¹¹⁵

Aristide concluded his presidential term in 1996. According to the constitution ratified in 1987, Haitians are ineligible to run for election in consecutive terms.¹¹⁶ Aristide selected longtime friend and Prime Minister René Préval as his candidate of choice. Préval was elected with 87.9 percent of the vote, even though less than 28 percent of the eligible population voted.¹¹⁷

¹¹³ Ballard, *Upholding Democracy*, 49.

¹¹⁴ Jerbi, *Political Parties and Democracy in Haiti*, 57.

¹¹⁵ Donald E. Schulz, "Whither Haiti?" *Small Wars & Insurgencies* 7, no. 3 (1996): 9.

¹¹⁶ Jerbi, *Political Parties and Democracy in Haiti*, 59.

¹¹⁷ *Ibid.*, 70.

After the election, many Haitians were concerned that Aristide would continue to rule through his good friend Préval, a fear that ended up being justified. Préval ruled largely through the popularity of Aristide. As relationships became strained between the two political leaders, Aristide split off and formed an opposition party, taking nearly all of the members of Préval's party with him.¹¹⁸

Préval had a tumultuous presidency including many conflicts with the Parliament. In January 1999, Préval shut down Haiti's parliament in an attempt to end the power struggle. Despite the conflicts, Préval was able to institute some economic reforms and ended up being a successful president. He became only the second Haitian to serve a full presidential term without Haiti being occupied by another country.¹¹⁹

In November 2000, Aristide was easily re-elected. His popularity as Haitian leader had never waned during the interim. Despite his national popularity, Aristide continued to foster international contempt. Much of the disdain centered on Aristide's claim that France had extorted over \$21 billion dollars from Haiti by force and should give it back to the Haitians.¹²⁰ In February 2004, the assassination of a gang leader began a period of violence in Haiti. Former members of the disbanded Haitian Army attempted a coup against Aristide. In an effort to suppress the violence and protect the president from a coup, the United States removed President Aristide and transported him to Africa. Even in Africa, Aristide remained popular and maintained great influence among the Haitian people.

Elections in 2006 returned René Préval to the presidency. This was a major victory for the popular sector, and a harsh defeat for both Haiti's elite class and the interim government.¹²¹ Democracy in Haiti was finally taking hold. The economy, affected by the worldwide crash in 2007–2008, had started to show promising signs. One could only wonder what disaster would befall Haiti next.

¹¹⁸ Jerbi, *Political Parties and Democracy in Haiti*, 70.

¹¹⁹ Ibid., 79.

¹²⁰ Farmer, "Who Removed Aristide?," 30.

¹²¹ Alex Dupuy, "Haiti Election 2006: A Pyrrhic Victory for René Préval?," *Latin American Perspectives* 33, no. 3 (2006): 132.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

III. SOCIOECONOMIC CONDITIONS IN HAITI

In early January 2010, Haiti was still the poorest country in the Western Hemisphere, but conditions were slowly improving. Haiti made significant developmental progress in security, judicial reform, macroeconomic management, procurement processes and fiscal transparency, increased voter registration, and jobs creation as the economy had shown some signs of improvement.¹²² Haiti's economy had been growing since 2004, even though the real capita GDP had declined 30% in the forty year period between the late 1960s and the early 2000s.¹²³

Even with its economy gradually improving, Haiti was still recovering from the destruction caused by several hurricanes in 2008. Over half of Haiti's population (54%) was living on less than U.S.\$1 per day, and 78% were living on U.S.\$2 or less per day. Less than 20% of the population was getting the minimum daily ration of food as defined by the World Health Organization (WHO).¹²⁴

Haiti also faced a significant income distribution gap and was dealing with the challenge of poverty reduction. The wealthiest 20% of Haitians were receiving more than 68% of Haiti's total national income; meanwhile, the poorest 20% received less than 1.5% of the national income. This accounted for the second largest income disparity in the world. Based on the level of income distribution inequality, the World Bank judged that utilizing economic growth to reduce poverty in Haiti was nearly impossible.¹²⁵

Haiti made an effort to decrease the income gap by passing a minimum wage law in 2009. The law mandated a two stage increase in minimum wages from U.S.\$1.75 per day to U.S.\$3.75 per day in 2010 and then to U.S.\$5.00 per day in October 2012.

¹²² Maureen Taft-Morales and Rhoda Margesson, *Haiti Earthquake: Crisis and Response*, (Washington, DC: CRS, 2010), 2.

¹²³ Maureen Taft-Morales, *Haiti: Current Conditions and Congressional Concerns*, (Washington, DC: CRS, 2009), 4.

¹²⁴ Ibid.

¹²⁵ Ibid.

Workers in the textile mills would earn U.S.\$5.25 per day. Even with the increased wages, the widespread inequality persisted with few perceptible changes in Haitian society.¹²⁶

In order to survive, many Haitians rely on remittances from family members living overseas. Due to the close proximity to the United States, there were around 1.7 million Haitians and Haitian Americans living in the United States as of 2010.¹²⁷ Haiti's large diaspora annually send between U.S.\$1.5 billion and U.S.\$2 billion, which supports approximately one third of the population.¹²⁸

Due to the widespread poverty in Haiti, the Inter-American Development Bank (IDB) designated Haiti as one of five countries to be included in its Fund for Special Operations in 2009. This fund committed a total of U.S.\$4.4 billion to nations struggling financially, and Haiti received U.S.\$511 million.¹²⁹ The portion allocated to Haiti covered the debt that it had accumulated prior to 2004.¹³⁰

A. JANUARY 12, 2010: THE PORT-AU-PRINCE EARTHQUAKE

Haiti would take another step backwards on January 12, 2010 when it was hit by a 7.0 Richter-scale earthquake, the most devastating natural disaster ever to occur in the Americas. The epicenter of the earthquake occurred just 15 miles southwest of Port-au-Prince in shallow waters in the Caribbean Sea, which made the surface tremors even stronger.¹³¹

The results were devastating. Approximately 230,000 people died in the earthquake, 300,000 were injured, over 1.5 million were displaced from their homes, and

¹²⁶ Maureen Taft-Morales, "Haiti under President Martelly," 13.

¹²⁷ Javed I. Niazi, "Comparative Analysis of Emergency Response Operations," 123.

¹²⁸ Looney, "Finally, Good News from Haiti," 2.

¹²⁹ "Haiti: Debt-Relief," Inter-American Development Bank, accessed November 23, 2014, <http://www.iadb.org/en/countries/haiti/debt-relief,1013.html>.

¹³⁰ "Haiti: Debt-Relief for Haiti," Inter-American Development Bank, accessed November 23, 2014, <http://www.iadb.org/en/mapamericas/haiti/debt-relief-for-haiti,4112.html>.

¹³¹ Jorge Heine and Andrew S. Thompson, *Fixing Haiti: MINUSTAH and Beyond* (New York: United Nations University, 2011), 1.

2 million were left needing food and assistance. There were roughly 285,000 homes destroyed, and damages to Haiti's infrastructure were estimated to be U.S.\$11 billion, including the Presidential Palace, the Parliament building, 15 out of 17 ministry buildings, and the Supreme Court.¹³²

President René Préval described conditions in Haiti immediately following the earthquake as “unimaginable” in an appeal for international aid. Basic services, including electricity and water, were nearly entirely disrupted. Loss of crucial infrastructure further complicated relief efforts. In addition to housing, numerous hospitals and schools were destroyed. The major road networks were either blocked or severely damaged, the control tower at the airport in Port-au-Prince was destroyed, and the main seaport was heavily damaged. There were also approximately 300 United Nations personnel lost in the earthquake, including the head of the U.N. Stabilization Mission in Haiti (MINUSTAH).¹³³

The challenges of recovering from a natural disaster the size of the earthquake were overwhelming. International aid groups provided tents and tarpaulins to over a half-million people, emergency food rations were delivered to 4.3 million people, and medical aid was provided to thousands of Haitians. Still, millions of Haitians were residing in camps that smelled of human waste and were forced to live under soaked bed sheets as their only source of shelter. The displaced Haitians were in dire need of continued support, having no means to produce their own food anytime soon and no long-term healthcare provisions.¹³⁴

At this point, the IDB committed to providing Haiti further financial relief. The devastating effects of the earthquake resulted in the decision to completely eliminate Haiti's debt. Haiti's remaining debts accumulated from 2004 through 2009 were cancelled by the IDB in September 2010, and Haiti was designated as a grant only

¹³² Heine and Thompson, *Fixing Haiti*, 1.

¹³³ Taft-Morales and Margesson, “Haiti Earthquake,” 1–2.

¹³⁴ Jonathan Katz, “Haiti Relief Money: Criticism of Nonprofits Abounds,” *Huffington Post*, May 5, 2010, http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2010/03/05/haiti-relief-money-critic_n_487976.html.

country in order to free Haiti from future indebtedness.¹³⁵ The IDB board of governors committed to forgiving Haiti's U.S.\$484 million outstanding debt and also converted U.S.\$144 million in undispersed loan balances into grants.¹³⁶ This endowment allows Haiti to use the scarce resources it has to meet the urgent humanitarian needs of the country instead of servicing past debt.

B. LEADERSHIP TRANSITION: THE MARTELLY ADMINISTRATION

As the earthquake recovery was beginning, Haiti was due to hold presidential elections. President René Préval was entering the final months of his second and final constitutional term in office when the earthquake occurred. He was greatly criticized for not being more proactive and outspoken about the magnitude of the damage caused and the great need for assistance in Haiti. President Préval's lack of advocacy following the earthquake, and the history of financial mismanagement in Haiti's government, raised concerns about how honorably the President would leave office. Haiti's presidents, Jean-Claude Duvalier in particular, have had a history of reallocating funds intended for the betterment of Haiti into their personal accounts prior to leaving office.¹³⁷ Even with the oversight from the United Nations on all of the aid money entering Haiti, alleviating President Préval of the temptation was a justifiable decision.

The process to elect Préval's successor began on November 28, 2010. The top two candidates in the primary election were Mirlande Manigat, a constitutional law professor and former first lady for President Leslie Maginat during one of the provisional presidential regimes immediately after the constitution was ratified, and Michel Martelly, a Haitian businessman and popular dance musician, particularly popular with the young voters. In the March 2011 runoff election, Martelly received 68% of the votes cast despite only 15% of the registered Haitian voters participating in the election.¹³⁸

¹³⁵ "Haiti: Debt-Relief for Haiti."

¹³⁶ Ibid.

¹³⁷ Taft-Morales, "Haiti under President Martelly," 9.

¹³⁸ Ibid., 4.

Martelly was inaugurated on May 14, 2011. The transition of power from President Préval to President Martelly marked the first time in Haiti's history of a peaceful democratic transition of a democratically elected government leader to a member of the opposition party.¹³⁹ The selection of Michel Martelly was a reason for concern for many Haitians and interested international groups. Although Martelly was a businessman, his financial skills were questionable. He had defaulted on over U.S.\$1 million in loans and had three properties in foreclosure in Florida.¹⁴⁰ Of greater concern to many Haitians and members of the international community were President Martelly's ties to the Duvalier regime. Martelly's administration was and still is in opposition to the party of widely popular former President Aristide, and it employs several former advisors and members of Duvalier's regime.¹⁴¹ With proper checks and balances, the Martelly administration could be kept accountable; however, having three fully functional branches of government has always been a problem in Haiti, which made accountability difficult.

Under President Martelly, the interactions among the three branches of government in Haiti have gradually improved. Three members of Haiti's Supreme Court have been selected by President Martelly. One of these appointments was the Supreme Court president, which is central to the judiciary's oversight body and had been vacant for the past six years. As a result, Haiti now has an appointed and functional executive, legislative, and judicial branches for the first time in over 25 years.¹⁴²

The relationship between the President and the Senate has seen similar signs of progress. Immediately after election, congress sought ratification of several constitutional amendments. These include provisions for streamlining the process for creating a permanent electoral council and for allowing dual-citizenship Haitians the right to vote

¹³⁹ Cheryl Mills, *Haiti-Two Years Post Earthquake: What You May Not Know*, U.S. Department of State, Dipnote: U.S. Department of State Official Blog, January 9, 2012, http://blogs.state.gov/index.php/site/entry/haiti_two_years_post_earthquake, 2.

¹⁴⁰ Taft-Morales, "Haiti under President Martelly," 4.

¹⁴¹ Randal C. Archibald, "Haiti Elections in Doubt as Ex-Presidents Stir Pot," *New York Times*, June 8, 2014.

¹⁴² Mills, *Haiti-Two Years Post Earthquake*, 2.

and hold government positions, which had been a source of frustration among the Haitian diaspora. According to Haiti's constitution, amendments that are passed by two consecutive legislatures go into effect when the next president takes office; however, there was a controversy over changed wording between the approved amendments and the amendments set to be published. After debating the issue, leaders of the executive, legislative, and judicial branches worked together to publish a mutually acceptable version of the amendments, marking a great step forward in Haiti's democratic process.¹⁴³

Even with the approved amendment for creating a permanent election council, the election process is threatening democracy in Haiti. Elections that should have taken place by January 2012 at the latest still have not taken place. Haiti's Senate is designed to select one-third of its members during each election cycle to ensure continuity. Since May 8, 2012, Haiti's Senate has been operating with only 20 of its members. With the 10 Senate seats unfilled, achieving a 16-member quorum to conduct business has been a challenge. Despite the Prime Minister's promises of holding elections by the end of 2012, elections have not been held. Elections are also long overdue for several other sectors of Haiti's society, including local elections for municipal councils, town delegates, and other posts.¹⁴⁴

Haiti was scheduled to hold another round of elections on October 26, 2014. Hours after the polls were scheduled to open President Martelly announced the elections would not take place as scheduled. This round of elections was supposed to elect 20 members of the Senate, the 10 seats vacant since 2012 and 10 seats that are set to expire in 2015, as well as the entire lower Parliament and numerous municipal officials. If elections are not held by January 15, 2015 and the terms of the next ten senators expire without any replacements, the senate will not have enough members to hold a quorum.

¹⁴³ Taft-Morales, "Haiti under President Martelly," 5.

¹⁴⁴ Ibid.

According to Haiti's constitution, Parliament would dissolve and President Martelly would rule by decree in this increasingly likely scenario.¹⁴⁵

Political opponents of President Martelly claim he has sought the opportunity to rule by decree and promised elections only in an effort to gain favor within the international community. There is no concrete proof to substantiate this assertion. In Haiti, the congress is designated the responsibility of holding elections. President Martelly's party does not hold a majority in the congress, and political gridlock has prevented progress towards holding elections. Martelly appears focused on keeping his legacy intact as the steward following the 2010 earthquake. He has even been supportive of the candidacy of his prime minister, Laurent Lamothe, as the next president.¹⁴⁶

Still, fears linger as there are ties between President Martelly and the Duvalier regimes. There is too much threat of a potential return to the authoritarian past that is so familiar to Haitian culture without having either a parliament or a national military in place and having a supportive, personally appointed Supreme Court. One of the few remaining checks to hold President Martelly accountable is the reaction of the international community. If Haiti were not so reliant on foreign aid, there would be little opposition to President Martelly becoming a dictator in the mold of Duvalier or Dessalines.

C. AID AND RECONSTRUCTION EFFORTS IN RESPONSE TO THE EARTHQUAKE

Despite fears of corruption and embezzlement, Haiti's government has used its resources responsibly due to the constraints from the United Nations and the international community. Instead of a lot of governmental interference, what Haiti has been forced to handle is an uncoordinated response to a complex problem. There were approximately 900 foreign and thousands of Haiti-based NGOs trying to provide support during the disaster relief efforts. These organizations tended to flock to the well-known

¹⁴⁵ Peter Granitz, "Haiti's Political Crisis is About to Get Worse," *Foreign Policy*, November 24, 2014, http://www.foreignpolicy.com/articles/2014/11/24/haiti_political_crisis_elections_martelly, 2.

¹⁴⁶ *Ibid.*, 3–4.

neighborhoods while neglecting many others, often with redundant services. The Haitian government was unable to create a coordinated response, but this is the way the international community designed Haiti's government to operate since President Aristide was removed from power in 2004. The inability of Haiti's government to respond to a crisis is partially the fault of the way the U.N. constrained the Haitian government.¹⁴⁷

There has been widespread blame for the inefficient disbursement of aid and recovery funds in Haiti. The Haitian government has been critical of the international donor community for the amount of time it has taken to deliver desperately needed funds. International donors blamed the delay in reconstruction efforts on the prolonged lack of a prime minister, ongoing gridlock in Haiti's legislative and executive branches, and the inability to organize elections. Haiti wants funds to flow through the government instead of directly to NGOs. Donors are concerned about corruption and the Haitian government's ability to design and implement programs.¹⁴⁸

The amount of money bypassing the Haitian government and flowing directly to NGOs became a major obstacle. Too much money was flowing into Haiti without any oversight. Prime Minister Jean-Max Bellerive has said, "The NGOs don't tell us where the money is coming from or how they are spending it. Too many people are raising money without any controls, and don't explain what they're doing with it."¹⁴⁹

In response to the earthquake, donors provided U.S.\$2.2 billion of humanitarian aid. Approximately twenty percent of that went to the U.S. Department of Defense and the 22,000 troops sent to carry out the relief operation. In total, less than one percent of the humanitarian aid and 15 percent of the recovery aid went to Haiti's government.¹⁵⁰

Although some NGOs have produced positive results in Haiti, there are many that ended up negatively impacting the local economy and the national infrastructure. Many privileged NGOs have been criticized for taking away human and monetary resources

¹⁴⁷ Looney, "Finally, Good News from Haiti," 1.

¹⁴⁸ Taft-Morales, "Haiti under President Martelly," 17.

¹⁴⁹ Ibid.

¹⁵⁰ Ibid., 5.

from the state, threatening the stability of national institutions. By taking away these resources, the NGOs have taken away accountability of the government to the local Haitian citizens and decreased the ability to deliver needed aid in a timely manner.¹⁵¹

The efforts of many NGOs and international aid organizations have been highly criticized for their inefficiency. Dieudonne Zidor, an elected official from an earthquake-ravaged slum neighborhood outside Port-au-Prince, was particularly critical of how the American Red Cross managed the U.S.\$20 million designated to improve her neighborhood, saying, “All they do is hold meetings and hand out juice. In the end, they will have spent the whole U.S.\$20 million giving juice to the people.”¹⁵²

Bypassing governmental controls makes recovering from a natural disaster much more challenging. The government does not know what needs have been addressed and where there is still need. Especially in governments with limited resources, like Haiti’s, extra measures need to be emplaced before committing resources that may no longer be needed.

Accountability of the incoming funds created further challenges. Even with U.N. and U.S. assurance that the NGOs receiving funds were closely monitored, during a crisis everything becomes more chaotic and quality control suffers. The U.S. Agency for International Development (USAID) required reports from receipt groups about how their funds had been spent and how their projects were progressing; however, USAID is often a source of funds for additional NGOs to execute projects. A sizable portion of the aid money designated for Haitians went to foreigners, primarily American aid workers. Within the first few months following the earthquake, USAID paid at least U.S.\$160 million to the Department of Defense, the Federal Emergency Management Agency, local search and rescue teams, and itself.¹⁵³

¹⁵¹ Zanotti, “Cacophonies of Aid.”

¹⁵² Deborah Sontag, “Rebuilding in Haiti Lags After Billions in Post-Quake Aid,” *New York Times*, December 23, 2012, <http://www.nytimes.com/2012/12/24/world/americas/in-aiding-quake-battered-haiti-lofty-hopes-and-hard-truths.html?ref=world&r=0&pagewanted=print>, 12–13.

¹⁵³ Katz, “Haiti Relief Money.”

The funds given to international aid workers could have been used to create jobs for Haitians and support the rebuilding of Haiti's infrastructure. In some cases, the aid organizations ended up hurting the Haitians they were designed to help. There were several occurrences where aid organizations bought food and other necessities from international sources instead of supporting the local economy. Buying food from highly subsidized sources and giving it to the Haitians drove many local farmers out of business.¹⁵⁴

In the months following the earthquake, foreigners took the lead on the reconstruction projects. With the amount of destruction and loss of life, Haitians were effectively excluded from the reconstruction coordination. Since the U.N. had already established a presence in Haiti through their MINUSTAH presence, coordination was taking place on the isolated and gated U.N. compound. Haiti's government was weak before the earthquake and was further crippled afterwards, but Haiti still belonged to the Haitians. Many Haitians could never get over the idea that they were an afterthought in the reconstruction of their country.¹⁵⁵

Almost all of Haiti's reconstruction projects were awarded to foreign agencies, nonprofit groups, and private contractors. These groups would then subcontract the work to others. The administrative cost for each level was around seven to ten percent, as the work was further subcontracted.¹⁵⁶

Foreign intervention caused further problems by the jobs they offered. Overcompensating for the oversight of excluding Haitians in the reconstruction planning when coordination began, the foreign teams offered high salaried jobs that appealed to many of the best-educated Haitians. These opportunities not only took the most capable Haitians away from government and private-sector jobs creating a leadership void but also brought back the preferential treatment of the mulatto elite class.¹⁵⁷

¹⁵⁴ Katz, "Haiti Relief Money."

¹⁵⁵ Sontag, "Rebuilding in Haiti Lags," 4.

¹⁵⁶ Ibid., 5.

¹⁵⁷ Ibid., 4.

Recovery efforts backed by the Haitian government and international donors focused on manufacturing and agricultural production. Both manufacturing and agriculture have made a steady recovery; however, the agricultural sector is limited by severe deforestation, with only an estimated 2% of Haiti's forest cover remaining, 85% of the watersheds degraded, rural infrastructure being minimal or absent, and access to credit being extremely limited. In the midst of the recovery process, hurricane Sandy's arrival in Haiti in 2012 did further damage to Haiti's agricultural land. The U.N. estimated an additional U.S.\$40 million would be needed to address the damage from hurricane Sandy. Despite the setback, Haiti's exports to the United States are up 41% since 2010 due to job creation in the manufacturing sector, tens of thousands of Haitian farmers have higher incomes, crime rates are down, and security has improved.¹⁵⁸

The IDB has also committed to assisting in Haiti's future financial security. Identifying the need for investments in reconstruction and long-term development, the IDB has pledged a total of nearly U.S.\$2.34 billion in grants through 2020. Subject to annual approvals, the yearly allotment of U.S.\$200 million is dedicated to projects in six critical sectors: education, water and sanitation, transport, energy, agriculture, and private sector development. Now Haiti's leading multilateral donor, the involvement of the IDB since the earthquake has been a crucial part of the country's recovery.¹⁵⁹

In addition to the support from the IDB, several nations committed funds to assist Haiti in its rebuilding efforts, which are expected to cost about U.S.\$14 billion. During a donor's conference held in March 2010, U.S.\$5.3 billion was pledged for Haiti's relief efforts; however, by August 2010, only Brazil, Norway, Australia, Colombia, and Estonia had followed through with their pledges. These five countries provided a total of U.S.\$506 million to Haiti's recover efforts, which is less than ten percent of the total pledged. In the early stages of the recovery process, when the need was most immediate,

¹⁵⁸ Taft-Morales, "Haiti under President Martelly," 14.

¹⁵⁹ "Haiti: IDB's Pledge," Inter-American Development Bank, accessed November 23, 2014, <http://www.iadb.org/en/mapamericas/haiti/idbs-pledge,4113.html>.

Haiti was faced with the challenge of recovery without the benefit of the funds designated to accomplish the task.¹⁶⁰

Even by the end of 2012, the majority of the funds designated for Haiti's relief and recovery had failed to reach the nation. Of the U.S.\$13.34 billion allocated to relief and recovery efforts in Haiti from 2010–2020 by multilateral and bilateral corporations, only U.S.\$6.43 billion or 48 percent has been dispersed. Private donors have contributed an additional \$3.06 billion to UN agencies and NGOs, adding a total of U.S.\$9.49 billion to Haiti's economy. Between 2010 and 2012, the Government of Haiti generated revenues of only U.S.\$3.17 billion. Tripling the national revenues combined with the forgiveness of Haiti's debt by the IDB has given Haiti yet another opportunity to provide for its people, rebuild its infrastructure, and revive its economy.¹⁶¹

Distribution of aid became a severe challenge. After the earthquake hit Haiti, over two million people were displaced from their homes and settled in temporary camps. In the subsequent seven weeks, nearly one-third of the camp dwellers reported not receiving any aid at all. Fifty-five percent had received some form of formal aid, typically just a tent or tarpaulin to provide shelter. Forty percent had received informal aid, which were mostly cash transfers from family members living abroad. Although the displaced Haitians were appreciative of any and all forms of aid they received, the most timely and effective aid was in the form of cash. That way, the people could determine their own needs and use the money to acquire it instead of receiving whatever happens to be donated.¹⁶²

Most of the blame for failing to distribute the aid coming into Haiti cannot be attributed to its government. Data collected by the United Nations special envoy to Haiti showed that U.S.\$582.3 million of the total disbursed funds went through Haiti's national systems for public financial management and procurement (NSPFM) between 2010 and

¹⁶⁰ Isabel Macdonald, "France's Debt of Dishonour to Haiti," *The Guardian*, August 16, 2010, <http://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/cifamerica/2010/aug/16/haiti-france>.

¹⁶¹ "Haiti Relief: Key Statistics," Office of the Special Envoy for Haiti, United Nations, accessed May 28, 2014, http://www.lessonsfromhaiti.org/download/International_Assistance/1-overall-key-facts.pdf, 1.

¹⁶² Versluis, "Formal and Informal Material Aid," S94.

2012. This is less than ten percent of the U.S.\$6.43 billion of public funds donated to Haiti. Only \$22.5 million, or less than one percent, of the \$2.41 billion designated as humanitarian aid went through Haiti's government using the NSPFM. Properly providing for the greatest needs of the people and restoring faith in the government is challenging when such a large portion of aid is bypassing the established government systems for distribution and aid. Considering the past mismanagement of Haiti's government and the immediate need of the people, the actions seem justifiable; however, the current government regime needs to be given the opportunity to earn the trust of the Haitian people and the international community in order to gain legitimacy.¹⁶³

Nearly three years after the earthquake, the chief accomplishment in Port-au-Prince was that finally most of the rubble had been cleared away. For the U.S.\$7.5 billion spent on Haiti's relief effort, that does not seem like much of an accomplishment. Over half of the aid money spent in Haiti was on consumable goods and services, including short-term jobs, emergency food and water, transitional shelters, and temporary clinics and schools. Even deducting the consumable amount from the total investment in Haiti's reconstruction more progress should have been achieved. When asked what went right and what went wrong, former Haitian Prime Minister Michèle Pierre-Louis answered, "Almost everything went wrong. When you look at things, you say, 'Hell, almost three years later, where is the reconstruction?' There needs to be some accountability for all that money."¹⁶⁴

Former President Bill Clinton, the U.N. special envoy for Haiti, and U.S. Secretary of State Hillary Rodham Clinton urged donors to start working with the government and stop working around it. Safe, permanent housing, the most obvious and pressing need, received a mere U.S.\$215 million. Donors shied away from the difficult and messy housing reconstruction and instead focused a large portion of the recovery funds on expensive current projects, like highway construction, H.I.V. prevention, creation of an industrial park in northern Haiti, and a new teaching hospital in the central

¹⁶³ "Haiti Relief: Key Statistics," Office of the Special Envoy for Haiti, United Nations, 2.

¹⁶⁴ Sontag, "Rebuilding in Haiti Lags," 1.

plateau. The result of the uncoordinated disaster response was a myriad of well-meaning projects with little lasting effect instead of making long-term investments to rebuild Haiti's infrastructure.¹⁶⁵

In many instances, the problem was not a lack of money but the ability to spend it, which was a new problem for Haiti. Between the United States and the Red Cross, there was over U.S.\$1.5 billion in the treasury dedicated for Haiti's reconstruction, with another U.S.\$85 million allocated by Spain to improve infrastructure so safe drinking water can be efficiently delivered. The challenges facing the Haitian government then became land and ideological disputes, logistical and contracting problems, staffing shortages, and weather. Although there were high unemployment rates and lots of work to do towards rebuilding Haiti, there were few skilled laborers able to help in the reconstruction.¹⁶⁶

Part of the problem was coordinating the logistics of the reconstruction effort. The money was ready to fund the projects, but the projects had to be contracted out and approved before reconstruction could take place. President Martelly aptly summed up the situation saying, "Building takes time; it's destruction that's rapid."¹⁶⁷

Haiti is still in desperate need of outside investment. Failure to hold elections, especially if the result is the dissolution of parliament, would end a large portion of the international aid Haiti needs to continue the process of recovery and development. Haiti does not have the infrastructure in place to survive independently.¹⁶⁸

Even though there were brief periods of economic progress, Haiti is still suffering the effects of negative economic growth in three of the past four decades. Roughly 75 percent of Haitians were unemployed or living off of the informal economy as of early 2013. Due to the political risks in Haiti, big businesses are reluctant to make major commitments. Over 80 percent of college educated Haitians have left the country. The

¹⁶⁵ Sontag, "Rebuilding in Haiti Lags," 2.

¹⁶⁶ Ibid., 3–4.

¹⁶⁷ Ibid., 3.

¹⁶⁸ "Haiti Relief: Key Statistics," Office of the Special Envoy for Haiti, United Nations, 4.

mass emigration of skilled workers, aggravated inequality, persistent poverty, and high unemployment limit the ability of the Haitian citizens to exploit opportunities that could lead to economic growth.¹⁶⁹

President Martelly's comments summed up Haiti's collective disappointment: "Where has the money given to Haiti after the earthquake gone? Most of the aid was used by non-governmental organizations for emergency operations, not for the reconstruction of Haiti. Let's look this square in the eye so we can implement a better system that yields results. We don't just want the money to come to Haiti. Stop sending money. Let's fix it [the international relief system]." ¹⁷⁰

D. SIGNS OF PROGRESS AND HOPE FOR THE FUTURE

The destruction caused by the earthquake left approximately 10 million cubic meters of rubble. Within the first two years, over half of the rubble had been removed. Removal of the visible reminder of the destruction is a necessary step in allowing Haiti to move forward.¹⁷¹

Two years after the earthquake, almost 1 million Haitians had left the camps and returned to structurally improved houses, temporary shelters, or permanent homes. Cooperative efforts between the U.S. government and USAID completed over 28,500 shelters that house an estimated 143,000 Haitians. Repairs and renovations were made to an additional 6,000 structures that were deemed as structurally safe if repairs were made. As a result, over 40,000 Haitians have returned to those homes.¹⁷²

Haiti's agriculture industry is beginning to rebound. Over 9,700 farmers have benefitted from improved seeds, technologies, techniques, and fertilizer through investments made in food security and agriculture. As a result, rice yields increased by 64

¹⁶⁹ Looney, "Finally, Good News from Haiti," 1.

¹⁷⁰ Clare Lockhart and Johanna M. Forman, "Escaping the Crisis Trap: New Options for Haiti," *Legatum Institute*, April 4, 2014, <http://www.li.com/publications/escaping-the-crisis-trap-new-options-for-haiti>, 10.

¹⁷¹ Mills, *Haiti-Two Years Post Earthquake*, 2.

¹⁷² Ibid.

percent, corn yields improved a robust 338 percent, bean crops increased 97 percent, and plantains increased by 21 percent. For 8,750 of Haiti's small farmers, incomes improved by over 50 percent.¹⁷³

As much damage as the earthquake caused, it seemed to draw the attention of international investors. These investors realized the potential market in Haiti in the months following the earthquake. As opportunities continue to arise, international investors have continued to increase their investments in the nation through the first few years of recovery. Approximately 1,000 business leaders from the private sector and government officials attended a multi-day symposium on business development opportunities in Haiti. There were representatives from 29 countries spanning Europe, Asia, and the Americas. One corporation, Marriot and Digicel, announced the construction of a 750 room hotel in Port-au-Prince that would bring in U.S.\$45 million of construction and development revenue and boost Haiti's tourist appeal.¹⁷⁴

Technological upgrades and an improved communication infrastructure are also contributing to investments in Haiti's economy, especially among the Haitian diaspora. Companies like Zafen, a non-profit funding source that provides interest free loans to Haitian entrepreneurs unable to qualify for funding through donations, are giving Haitians a chance to create a niche in the local economy. Another company, Fonkoze, has grown into the country's largest microfinance institution. Fonkoze has been extremely successful, due in large part to distributing the loans made by Zafen. Although reviving Haiti's economy will take time, ventures like these will help to stimulate and develop local economies, with a lot of potential for future growth.¹⁷⁵

Perhaps the greatest reason to hope in the future of Haiti is the resilience of the Haitian people. Enduring dictators and natural disasters, living through centuries of

¹⁷³ Mills, *Haiti-Two Years Post Earthquake*, 4.

¹⁷⁴ Ibid.

¹⁷⁵ Looney, "Finally, Good News from Haiti," 2.

poverty and oppression, Haitians have shown the ability to adapt and survive anything.¹⁷⁶

Haiti has numerous needs that need to be met with the disaster relief funds that have not yet been dispersed, as well as future international relief funds that Haiti is scheduled to receive from the IDB. If Haiti is going to achieve economic prosperity in the near-term, it will have to allocate a large portion of these funds towards fostering proper security, education, and economic opportunities. Maintaining security is an essential step in fostering economic growth. Ensuring Haiti's police force is properly prepared to accept the mission as the U.N. forces transition out will be essential in retaining stability. The future of Haiti will be dependent on educated Haitians both currently in Haiti and from the diaspora. Educational goals should focus on developing skill sets that are relevant to Haiti's current and future needs. Additionally, growing economic opportunities in Haiti will give the people the most visible symbol of hope as job availability and the livelihood of the people increase.¹⁷⁷

¹⁷⁶ Gibbons, "Haiti: Cultural and Social Aspects."

¹⁷⁷ Lockhart and Forman, "Escaping the Crisis Trap," 25.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

IV. CONCLUSIONS

Humanitarian assistance provided by the international community can be considered a lifeline for any country following a major disaster. The aim of this thesis was to analyze the level of effectiveness of the development assistance that Haiti has received since 2010. Nearly five years after the earthquake, the following conclusions can be drawn:

- There is a need for a coordinated international response that can focus solely on meeting the most immediate concerns of the affected nation.

The international response to the earthquake in Haiti was a disaster. The government was bypassed due to fears of weakness and corruption, but any chance of restoring legitimacy and providing the opportunity to lead recovery efforts was lost. Haitians were excluded from the recovery planning process of their own country in favor of the international reconstruction experts. National priorities were not taken into consideration as the aid and reconstruction money were allocated to different projects. Many privileged NGOs were awarded large contracts that were subcontracted with high administrative fees, benefitting the NGOs and not the Haitian people. The reconstruction efforts were uncoordinated and haphazard. Redundant services were provided in some locations while other locations were ignored. Some areas received an abundance of a certain type of aid but could not get the aid needed (i.e., having access to food but not shelter).

In the future, having a particular organization designated as being responsible for disaster response coordination with the affected government would be beneficial. Whether this entity is the United Nations, the Red Cross, a nation designated as the lead agent, or another organization, there should be a response team that has the authority to coordinate with the affected nation's government to prioritize responses to the disastrous event. This type of entity would be particularly valuable in places where the government is weak or fragile to begin with and in places where the nation's government is disrupted

by the natural disaster. Haiti would qualify in both scenarios. The designated entity would then be responsible for ensuring that allocated funds are disbursed responsibly, both for the greatest need of the nation and to meet the categorical requirements of the donated funds.

- Controlling interest groups present a challenge to recovery and progress, especially when there are unexpected, large sums of money are brought into a nation.

In Haiti, as in many other countries, the educated class is afforded the greatest opportunities and controls most of the wealth. When large sums of international aid designated for national assistance or recovery enter the country, strict oversights must be maintained to ensure the elite class is not procuring these funds for themselves at the expense of the intended recipient. The educated elite class in Haiti was repeatedly afforded opportunities that allowed them to increase their personal wealth at the expense of the government, the reconstruction efforts, and the poor, displaced Haitians that needed the funds to recover from the disaster. In a nation that was already suffering from wealth inequality and then experienced a crippling natural disaster, implementing a means of wealth re-distribution may be a rational option to ensure that everyone will work together for the benefit of national recovery.

- Haiti's culture will limit the acceptance of outside influence.

Haiti has repeatedly shown an unwillingness to accept outside interventions, even when the results were a substantial improvement over the previous conditions. Most notably immediately after achieving independence from France and after the United States withdrew its forces in 1934, Haiti resented the advancements forced upon it and reverted to a dilapidated state. Increased globalization and cultural shifts may make the response of the Haitian people different in this situation; however, failure to see any progress resulting from the aid and recovery funds allocated to Haiti should not be surprising.

- Elections need to take place to ensure continuity of international aid.

Haiti finds itself at another crossroads in history. Haiti's national debt has been cancelled by the IDB. There are aid and recovery funds still available waiting for the bureaucracy of proper contracting and procurement of skilled labor to enact the much needed improvements to infrastructure in Haiti. Furthermore, more international assistance funds are scheduled to be delivered to help aid the revival of Haiti's economy. The fact that parliamentary elections have been scheduled for the past two years, and have not taken place represents a threat to Haiti's future.

Haiti's government has repeatedly regressed from democratic rule into a dictatorship; unless substantial progress is made towards holding democratic elections in the immediate future, Haiti may once again become a dictatorship. If elections do not take place by January 2015, Haiti's parliament will be disbanded, and President Martelly will rule by decree. Historically, when a Haitian president takes the opportunity to rule by decree, he declares himself dictator for life. This happened with President Dessalines in the early 1800s and with President François Duvalier in the mid-twentieth century. Since President Martelly is a Duvalierist, he may be inclined to follow in their footsteps.

The situation in Haiti must be closely monitored for the next year. Presidential elections are scheduled to take place at the end of 2015. According to Haiti's constitution, elections must be directed by the parliament. If and when parliament gets disbanded, President Martelly will have the authority to direct elections. If President Martelly acts in good faith towards continuing the democratic governance of Haiti, there should be no reason to suspend aid to the country; however, if President Martelly does not make an effort to re-establish the parliament or hold the regularly scheduled presidential elections, the decision to continue providing aid must be reassessed.

- If Haiti does revert from a democracy into authoritarian rule and there is an intervention, the United States should be involved in the intervention.

Due to the proximity and the large Haitian diaspora, if there is a future intervention in Haiti, the United States should be involved probably as the lead agent. Intervention should be part of an international coalition, likely under the direction of the

United Nations, and not a unilateral action. Even though Haiti possesses a minimal threat to United States security interests, its location provides an advantageous strategic position for staging troops if a future conflict should arise. Additionally, the lobbying of the diaspora to intervene on behalf of their native land could be a pivotal political issue in an upcoming election.

- The impoverished masses of Haitian citizens will make a positive impact if given the opportunity.

Haiti's citizens have shown as great an ability to survive and endure as a culture as any people in history. They are willing to work together and will do whatever they can to improve their situation within the means available to them. Increasing educational opportunities, providing apprenticeship opportunities, and making available the resources to improve their communities is among the best investments Haiti can make to ensure its future prosperity.

- Reforestation of Haiti will aid in national sustainability in the future.

The deforestation of Haiti has left the nation with little remaining arable land and a high degree of soil erosion. Reforestation of Haiti will help improve the soil so farmers can grow sustenance crops and become less reliant on imported crops. Increasing food output in Haiti has numerous advantages in that it provides jobs for farmers, decreases the amount of money Haiti has to pay other nations for food, and provides locally grown food for Haitian citizens.

- Globalization has proven to be both positive and negative for Haiti's economy.

Developing Haiti's economy through companies like Zafen and Fonkoze has been a positive aspect of globalization. Investment opportunities in Haiti have increased and the opportunity for entrepreneurship in Haiti was correspondingly created. As these opportunities increase and take root, local economies will continue to progress resulting in greater future economic potential.

The negative aspects of globalization were highlighted during the relief response to Haiti's earthquake. Relief organizations looked for the most economical source of food to provide the Haitian citizens. As a result, highly subsidized food sources were selected instead of procuring food from the local economy, which made farming no longer a viable source of income due to non-competitive prices. As the economy stabilizes and globalization increases in Haiti, the nation will have to evaluate the feasibility of providing subsidies, particularly for agricultural products.

After nearly five years of investment in the recovery of Haiti, the results are far below expectations, but there are still several reasons for hope. Much of the disbursed aid has gone to meet the immediate aid of the Haitian citizens and has been consumed with no lasting effect. Too much aid money has gone to corrupt NGOs that have used the funds to further their controlling interests rather than to help the people they were designed to help. Yet there are still great amounts of money designated to aid Haiti's future reconstruction. In Haiti there will always be needs to be met, but with every challenge there is an opportunity. I encourage everyone to stay committed to the reconstruction of Haiti and chase the opportunities it presents.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

APPENDIX

Table 1. Presidents of Haiti¹⁷⁸

President	Year(s) in Office	Term In Office
Jean Jacques Dessalines	1804–1806	Assassinated
Henri Christophe	1807–1820	Suicide
Alexander Pétion	1807–1818	Died in Office
Jean Pierre Boyer	1818–1843	Overthrown
Riviere Rivière-Hérard	1843–1844	Overthrown
Philippe Guerrier	1844–1845	Died in Office
Jean Louis Pierrot	1845–1846	Overthrown
Jean-Baptiste Riché	1847–1847	Died in Office
Faustin Soulouque	1847–1859	Overthrown
Fabre Nicholas Geffrard	1859–1867	Overthrown
Sylvain Salnave	1867–1869	Executed
Saget Nissage	1870–1874	Served Full Term
Michel Domingue	1874–1876	Overthrown
Pierre Théoma Boisrond-Canal	1876–1879	Overthrown
Lysius Felicite Salomon	1879–1888	Overthrown
François Denys Légitime	1888–1889	Overthrown
Florvil Hyppolite	1889–1896	Died in Office
Tirésias Simon Sam	1896–1902	Resigned
Alexis Nord	1902–1908	Overthrown
François C. Antoine Simon	1908–1911	Overthrown
Cincinnatus Leconte	1911–1912	Died in Office
Tancrède Auguste	1912–1913	Died in Office
Michel Oreste	1913–1914	Overthrown
Oreste Zamor	1914	Overthrown
Joseph Davilmar Théodore	1914–1915	Overthrown
Vilbrun Sam	1915	Assassinated
Philippe Sudré Dartiguenave	1915–1922	Served Full Term
Louis Borno	1922–1930	Served Full Term
Louis Eugène Roy	1930	Provisional
Sténio Vincent	1930–1941	Served Full Term
Élie Lescot	1941–1946	Overthrown
Franck Lavaud	1946	Provisional

¹⁷⁸ Buss and Adam Gardner, *Haiti in the Balance*, 187-188; Taft-Morales, *Haiti Under President Martelly*, 4.

Dumarsais Estimé	1946–1950	Overthrown
Paul Eugène Magloire	1950–1956	Overthrown
Joseph Nemours Pierre-Louis	1956–1957	Provisional
Franck Sylvain	1957	Provisional
Executive Government Council	1957	Provisional
Antonio Thrasybule Kebreau	1957	Chair, Military Council
François Duvalier	1957–1971	Died in Office
Jean-Claude Duvalier	1971–1986	Overthrown
Henri Namphy	1986–1987	Provisional
Lesli Manigat	1988	Overthrown
Henri Namphy	1988–1989	Overthrown
Prosper Avril	1989–1990	Overthrown
Etha Pascal-Trouillot	1990–1991	Provisional
Jean-Bertrand Aristide	1991	Overthrown
Joseph Nerette	1991–1992	Provisional
Marc Bazin	1992–1993	Interim
Émile Jonassaint	1994	Interim
Jean-Bertrand Aristide	1994–1996	Finished Remainder of Term
René Préval	1996–2000	Served Full Term
Jean-Bertrand Aristide	2000–2004	Overthrown
Boniface Alexandre	2004–2006	Provisional
René Préval	2006–2011	Served Full Term
Michel Martelly	2011-present	Term Ends in February 2016

LIST OF REFERENCES

- “2010–2012 Overall Contributions from Public Sector Donors to Relief and Recovery Efforts in Haiti as of December 2012, in USD Millions (Excluding Debt Relief).” Office of the Special Envoy for Haiti. United Nations. Accessed June 4, 2014. http://www.lessonsfromhaiti.org/download/International_Assistance/2-overall-financing-data.pdf.
- Allende, Victor, and Jorge Anaya. “Collaboration in Humanitarian Logistics: Comparative Analysis of Disaster Response in Chile and Haiti 2010.” Master’s thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, 2010.
- Archibald, Randal C. “Haiti Elections in Doubt as Ex-Presidents Stir Pot.” *New York Times*. June 8, 2014.
- Ballard, John R. *Upholding Democracy: The United States Military Campaign in Haiti, 1994–1997*. Westport, CT: Praeger, 1998.
- Bellegarde-Smith, Patrick. *Haiti: The Breached Citadel*. San Francisco: Westview Press, 1990.
- Burnside, A. Craig, and David Dollar. “Aid, Policies, and Growth: Revisiting the Evidence.” *World Bank Policy Research Paper* (2004): 1–35.
- Buss, Terry F., and Adam Gardner. *Haiti in the Balance: Why Foreign Aid Has Failed and What We Can Do About It*. Washington, DC: Brookings Institution Press, 2008.
- Buss, Terry F., and Adam Gardner. “Why Foreign Aid to Haiti Failed—and How to Do It Better Next Time.” Louis A. Picard, Robert Groselasma, and Terry F. Buss, eds., *Foreign Aid and Foreign Policy: Lessons for the Next Half-Century* (2005): 173–213.
- Casper, Michael F. “Analysis of Social Network Collaboration Using Selected APAN Communications From the Haiti Earthquake of 2010.” Master’s thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, 2012.
- Diederich, Bernard, and Al Burt. *Papa Doc: The Truth About Haiti Today*. New York: McGraw-Hill, 1969.
- Donaldio, Marcela. *A Comparative Atlas of Defense in Latin America and Caribbean*. Buenos Aires: RESDAL, 2012.
- Dubois, Laurent. *Avengers of the New World: The Story of the Haitian Revolution*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 2004.

- . *Haiti: The Aftershocks of History*. New York: Metropolitan Books, 2012.
- Dupuy, Alex. "Haiti Election 2006: A Pyrrhic Victory for René Prével?" *Latin American Perspectives* 33, no. 3 (2006): 132–141.
- Farmer, Paul. "Who Removed Aristide?" *London Review of Books* 26, no. 8 (2004): 28–31.
- Fatton, Robert. *Haiti's Predatory Republic: The Unending Transition to Democracy*. Boulder, CO: Lynne Rienner Publishers, 2002.
- Finer, Samuel E. *The Man on Horseback: The Role of the Military in Politics*. Piscataway, NJ: Transaction Publishers, 2003.
- "From Duvalier to Avril, 1957–89." Library of Congress. Accessed June 17, 2014. <http://countrystudies.us/haiti/65.htm>.
- Gibbons, Deborah E. "Haiti: Cultural and Social Aspects of Recovery and Growth." *Feet on the Ground: Humanitarian Work Across Cultures*, Monterey, CA: Naval Postgraduate School, 2011.
- Granitz, Peter. "Haiti's Political Crisis is About to Get Worse." *Foreign Policy*. Accessed November 24, 2014. http://www.foreignpolicy.com/articles/2014/11/24/haiti_political_crisis_elections_martelly.
- "Haiti: Debt-Relief." Inter-American Development Bank. Accessed November 23, 2014. <http://www.iadb.org/en/countries/haiti/debt-relief,1013.html>.
- "Haiti: Debt-Relief for Haiti." Inter-American Development Bank. Accessed November 23, 2014. <http://www.iadb.org/en/mapamericas/haiti/debt-relief-for-haiti,4112.html>.
- "Haiti: IDB's Pledge." Inter-American Development Bank. Accessed November 23, 2014. <http://www.iadb.org/en/mapamericas/haiti/idbs-pledge,4113.html>.
- "Haiti Relief: Key Statistics." Office of the Special Envoy for Haiti. United Nations. Accessed May 28, 2014. http://www.lessonsfromhaiti.org/download/International_Assistance/1-overall-key-facts.pdf.
- Heine, Jorge, and Andrew S. Thompson. *Fixing Haiti: MINUSTAH and Beyond*. New York: United Nations University, 2011.
- Heinl Robert D., and Nancy G. Heinl. *Written in Blood: The Story of the Haitian People, 1492–1971*. Boston, MA: Houghton Mifflin, 1978.

Hutchins, Susan G., Ying Zhao, and Tony Kendall. "Investigating Inter-organizational Collaboration During the Haiti Relief Effort From a Macrocognition Perspective." Master's thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, 2011.

"International Assistance: General Information on the Status of Aid to Haiti." Office of the Secretary-General's Special Adviser on Community-Based Medicine & Lessons Learned from Haiti. United Nations. Accessed May 28, 2014.
http://www.lessonsfromhaiti.org/download/International_Assistance/1-overall-key-facts.pdf.

Jerbi, Matthew J. "Political Parties and Democracy in Haiti." Master's thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, 2001.

Johns, Scott T. "Macrocognition in Teams and Analysis of Information Flow During the Haiti Disaster Relief." Master's thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, 2011.

Katz, Jonathan. "Haiti Relief Money: Criticism of Nonprofits Abounds." *Huffington Post*. May 5, 2010. http://www.huffingtonpost.com/2010/03/05/haiti-relief-money-critic_n_487976.html.

Knight, Franklin W. "The Haitian Revolution," *American Historical Review* 105, no. 1 (2000): 103–115.

Lockhart, Clare, and Johanna M. Forman. "Escaping the Crisis Trap: New Options for Haiti." *Legatum Institute*. April 4, 2014.
<http://www.li.com/publications/escaping-the-crisis-trap-new-options-for-haiti>.

Logan, Rayford Whittingham. *Haiti and the Dominican Republic*. New York: Oxford Univ. Press, 1968.

Looney, Robert. "Finally, Good News From Haiti." *Foreign Policy (blog)* Last modified May 3, 2013.
http://www.foreignpolicy.com/articles/2013/05/03/finally_good_news_from_haiti.

Lysne, Brian K., and Clayton C. Beas. "Using a Model of Team Collaboration to Investigate Inter-organizational Collaboration During the Relief Effort of the January 2010 Haiti Earthquake." Master's thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, 2011.

Macdonald, Isabel. "France's Debt of Dishonour to Haiti." *The Guardian*. August 16, 2010. <http://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/cifamerica/2010/aug/16/haiti-france>.

Mills, Cheryl. *Haiti—Two Years Post Earthquake: What You May Not Know*. U.S. Department of State. Dipnote: U.S. Department of State Official Blog. January 9, 2012.
http://blogs.state.gov/index.php/site/entry/haiti_two_years_post_earthquake.

- Niazi, Javed Iqbal Khan. "Comparative Analysis of Emergency Response Operations Haiti Earthquake in January 2010 and Pakistan's Flood in 2010." Master's thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, 2011.
- Nichols, David. "Haiti: The Rise and Fall of Duvalierism." *Third World Quarterly* 8, no. 4 (1986): 1239–1252.
- O'Neal, Julie J. "U.S. Intervention in Grenada, Panama, and Haiti: A Social Constructionist Perspective." Master's thesis, Naval Postgraduate School, 1995.
- "Operation Uphold Democracy." GlobalSecurity.org. Accessed June 2, 2014.
http://www.globalsecurity.org/military/ops/uphold_democracy.htm.
- Renda, Mary A. *Taking Haiti: Military Occupation and the Culture of U.S. Imperialism, 1915–1934*. Chapel Hill, NC: University of North Carolina Press, 2001.
- Rotberg, Robert I., and Christopher K. Clague. *Haiti; the Politics of Squalor*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin, 1971.
- Schmidt, Hans. *The United States Occupation of Haiti, 1915–1934*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1971.
- Schuller, Mark. *Killing With Kindness: Haiti, International Aid, and NGOs*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 2012.
- Schuller, Mark, and Pablo Morales. *Tectonic Shifts: Haiti Since the Earthquake*. Sterling, VA.: Kumarian Press, 2012.
- Shamsie, Yasmine, and Andrew S. Thompson. *Haiti: Hope for a Fragile State*. Waterloo, Ont.: Wilfrid Laurier University Press, 2006.
- Schulz, Donald E. "Whither Haiti?" *Small Wars & Insurgencies* 7, no. 3 (1996): 324–359.
- Sontag, Deborah. "Rebuilding in Haiti Lags After Billions in Post-Quake Aid." *New York Times*. December 23, 2012.
http://www.nytimes.com/2012/12/24/world/americas/in-aiding-quake-battered-haiti-lofty-hopes-and-hard-truths.html?ref=world&_r=0&pagewanted=print.
- Taft-Morales, Maureen. *Haiti: Current Conditions and Congressional Concerns*. Washington, DC: CRS, 2009.
- Taft-Morales, Maureen. *Haiti Under President Martelly: Current Conditions and Congressional Concerns*. Washington, DC: CRS, 2014.
- Taft-Morales, Maureen, and Rhoda Margesson. *Haiti Earthquake: Crisis and Response*. Washington, DC: CRS, 2010.

- United States. Congress. Senate. Committee on Foreign Relations. *A Bill to Promote Sustainable Private Sector Growth and Economic Development in Haiti: Report (to Accompany S. 954)* (Washington, DC: U.S. G.P.O., 2011).
- United States. Congress. Senate. Committee on Foreign Relations. Subcommittee on Western Hemisphere, Peace Corps, and Economic Affairs United States. Congress. Senate. Committee on Foreign Relations. Subcommittee on International Development and Foreign Assistance. *Rebuilding Haiti in the Martelly Era: A Joint Hearing Before the Subcommittee On Western Hemisphere, Peace Corps, and Global Narcotics Affairs and the Subcommittee On International Development and Foreign Assistance, Economic Affairs, and International Environmental Protection of the Committee On Foreign Relations, United States Senate, One Hundred Twelfth Congress, First Session, June 23, 2011* (Washington, DC: U.S. G.P.O., 2011).
- U.S. Department of State. *Milestones: 1914–1920: U.S. Invasion and Occupation of Haiti, 1915–1934*. Office of the Historian.
<https://history.state.gov/milestones/1914–1920/haiti>.
- Versluis, Anna. “Formal and Informal Material Aid Following the 2010 Haiti Earthquake as Reported by Camp Dwellers.” *Disasters* 38, no. 1 (2014): S94-S109.
- Zanotti, Laura. “Cacophonies of Aid, Failed State Building and NGOs in Haiti: Setting the Stage for Disaster, Envisioning the Future.” *Third World Quarterly* 31, no. 5 (2010): <http://www.tandfonline.com/doi/full/10.1080/01436597.2010.503567>. 755–771.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK

INITIAL DISTRIBUTION LIST

1. Defense Technical Information Center
Ft. Belvoir, Virginia
2. Dudley Knox Library
Naval Postgraduate School
Monterey, California